

THE HONORIFIC LOSS IN JAVANESE-INDONESIAN MOVIE SUBTITLE

Asrofin Nur Kholifah

English Department, Faculty of Humanities Universitas Jenderal Soedirman

Email: asrofin.kholifah@unsoed.ac.id

Abstract

Subtitled short movies in Indonesian context allow broader and larger viewers. Bringing up less commercial issues, these kinds of movies offer somehow new insight for spectators. When it comes to subtitling, the process of transferring from the spoken to the written mode along with the different languages has always become challenge for the movie translator. The language and cultural differences between the native audiences opposed to the target audiences often demands translator to take the right decision to transfer. However, language and cultural barrier persist and even it fails to accommodate. To provide the clearer depiction of this fact, this research accordingly aims to investigate the honorific loss in Javanese-Indonesian subtitle of *Lemantun* movie. In particular, it investigates the forms of Javanese honorifics then explains how the Javanese honorific forms fails to be translated into Indonesian subtitle. This study is descriptive qualitative by focusing on the description of the use of honorifics in Javanese subtitle and its loss in Indonesian version. The data were gathered through observation and transcription in both original and translated versions. The data were then interpreted by involving situational and social context as depicted on the screen. The result demonstrated that the honorific forms are identified through its speech level: *krama* (high honorific), *madya* (moderate) and *ngoko* (low) represented in different situation involving different interlocutors. In this movie, the honorific forms is used between (1) children to mother, (2) younger to older sibling, and (3) younger to the respected family member. Unfortunately, the honorific fails to transfer as a consequence of the different linguistic system and linguistic behaviour within which the language is produced. The Indonesian subtitle could not accommodate the honorific nuance as explicitly reflected in the original version. The linguistic behavior and system here become the key factors causing the transfer fails.

Keywords: Javanese honorifics, translation loss, subtitle, *Lemantun*.

Abstrak

Film pendek bersulih bahasa di Indonesia memungkinkan menjaring penonton yang lebih luas bahkan manca negara. Film jenis ini bisanya mengangkat isu yang unik dan cenderung kurang komersil namun kerap kali menyuguhkan pandangan baru bagi penikmatnya. Berbicara tentang sulih bahasa atau yang lebih dikenal dengan subtitle, proses pengalihan pesan dari media lisan ke media tulis telah menjadi tantangan tersendiri oleh penerjemah selama ini. Perbedaan latar budaya dan bahasa antara penonton bahasa asli dan penonton di bahasa sasaran menuntut penerjemah untuk mengambil keputusan yang tepat dalam mengalihkan pesan. Namun demikian, hambatan budaya nyatanya masih terjadi selama proses berlangsung. Berkaitan dengan hal ini, penelitian ini bertujuan untuk menjelaskan hilangnya bentuk hormat dalam subtitle bahasa Jawa ke bahasa Indonesia di film *Lemantun*. Khususnya, studi ini menjelaskan bentuk-bentuk hormat bahasa Jawa dan juga menggambarkan bagaimanabentuk tuturan tersebut gagal diterjemahkan ke dalam bahasa Indonesia. Jenis penelitian ini kualitatif deskriptif yang memusatkan perhatiannya pada deskripsi bentuk-bentuk hormat dan hilangnya bentuk tersebut ke dalam subtitle bahasa Indonesia. Data dihasilkan melalui transkripsi baik teks asli maupun terjemahannya lalu dikaji dengan melibatkan konteks situasi dan sosial sebagaimana tergambar di layar. Hasil studi ini mengungkapkan bahwa tuturan bentuk hormat ditandai oleh tingkat tutur yaitu *krama*, *madya* dan *ngoko* yang tersaji dalam situasi dan partisipan yang berbeda. Dalam film ini, bentuk hormat digunakan antara (1) anak ke ibunya, (2) adik ke kakak, dan (3) anak kepada orang yang dihormati di dalam keluarga. Sayangnya bentuk ini gagal diterjemahkan ke dalam bahasa Indonesia karena perbedaan sistem kebahasaan dan perilaku berbahasa dimana bahasa ini digunakan. Subtitle Indonesia tidak dapat mengakomodasi nuansa hormat yang secara eksplisit terlihat di versi asli. Perilaku dan sistem kebahasaan dalam kasus ini menjadi faktor penting yang menyebabkan gagalnya bentuk hormat dipertahankan.

Kata kunci: bentuk hormat bahasa Jawa, kegagalan penerjemahan, subtitle, *Lemantun*.

INTRODUCTION

The increase of short films in Indonesian context cannot be overlooked. Since the close down of Department of Information in 1999 as the consequence of the fall of new order era in 1998, the film regulation is no longer strict (Mediarta, 2007: 308). A number of film producers create short films then upload them on *YouTube* and other social media platforms. In particular, it is when everyone is asked to stay at home along with the Covid 19 pandemic. To make people feel more comfortable staying at home, some filmmakers upload their works on *Youtube* channel for broader viewers. One of them is the 2014 short film *Lemantun* which was uploaded on Youtube by the director himself on April 10, 2020. This film is the work of a young director Wregas Bhanutedja who won several awards including Best Short Film XXI Short Film Festival 2015, Best Short Film Appreciation Indonesia 2015 and Best Short Film Maya Cup 2015. Interestingly, this Javanese setting film explored linguistic varieties in terms of speech level throughout the movie dialogues. The use of *krama* (high variety) and *ngoko* (low variety) is then intriguing to disclose as one of linguistic phenomena.

The film began with a mother's wish who bequeathed five cupboards to her five children. It said that the cupboards were a marker of the birth of the mother's children. Every time a child was born, the mother bought a cupboard. The interesting thing is that after being distributed, each child had to take his cupboard home on the same day. The reason is so that the mother feels relieved. As a child, this commandment must be obeyed because it is a legal sin to disobey parents' orders. Yet, this becomes a problem for Tri, the third child who stays unmarried and lives at the house.

With a Javanese family background, all of the dialogue in this film uses Javanese with the Yogyakarta dialect. Throughout the film, the Javanese speech levels, both *krama* and *ngoko*, are used by the characters in the film according to their respective roles. To provide access to messages for spectators who do not understand Javanese, Indonesian subtitles are provided.

Subtitling is defined as a process of providing synchronized captions for film and

television dialogue (Shuttleworth & Cowie, 1997: 161). In a subtitle, the translator deals with a unique phenomenon, that is, the source text is an oral text supported by place settings, musical illustrations, character expressions and other visual contents. However, he must translate the spoken text into the written text. Then, in translation, the meaning of a text will be influenced by the context of the situation while the context of the situation is influenced by the cultural context. In the translation process, the context of the situation and cross-cultural understanding are the main provisions the translator must possess to choose the right translation technique. This is in line with Newmark (1988) which stated that the produced texts always involve individuals, cultures, and universals as language characteristics so that translators must understand linguistic as well as cultural background regarding the source and target language.

Meanwhile, from the aspect of viewers or audiences, they during the image reading simultaneously have to deal with four different types of signs:

1. Verbal acoustic signs (dialogue)
 2. Non-verbal acoustic signs (music, sound effects)
 3. Verbal visual signs (verbal signs written on the screen)
 4. Non-verbal visual signs (other than those seen in other than verbal language)
- (Delabastita in Spanakaki, 2007)

As a social phenomenon, language use is not only determined by linguistic factors but also by non-linguistic factors. Linguistic factors that influence the use of language include social factors and situational factors. Social factors such as social status, education level, age, economic level, and gender. On the other hand, situational factors determine the way the speakers deliver their speech. For example, the language used in formal situations will be different from that of being used in casual situations. Official situations tend to affect speakers using the official language, while in relaxed situations they tend to affect speakers using a variety of informal languages (Suwito 1985: 3).

In Javanese, the variation based on social levels is called *undha usuk*. The existence of speech levels called *undha usuk* causes speakers from the Javanese speaking community to know in advance their social level position against the interlocutor. In relation to this, the Javanese language is divided into two levels, *krama* and *ngoko* (Chaer and Agustina, 2004:40).

The Javanese speech community pays great attention to politeness in interaction. The selection of the appropriate language variety reflects the status among speakers. The higher

the status of the speech partner, the higher the speech level chosen by the speaker. Moreover, to select the speech level of either *ngoko*, *madya* or *krama*, Javanese speakers also add a dimension of politeness by using high variety (*krama*) and low variety (*ngoko*). Acting politely for the Javanese community involves complex linguistic aspects (Holmes, 2013: 290). Factors that influence the choice of speech level in Javanese society involve age, gender, kinship factors, social status and the level of formality in which the conversation takes place. Someone will be said to be polite if they are able to use the appropriate level of speech by paying attention to these social factors.

The variety of *krama* is usually used by speakers as a form of respect for the interlocutor with various social dimensions such as age, level of closeness, occupation and social status. Meanwhile, the variety of *ngoko* is usually used by speakers to speech partners who are younger and closer in age. These two varieties are often found in the Javanese speech community during their interactions.

Speaking of subtitles from Javanese to Indonesian, this variety cannot be accommodated by Indonesian because of the differences of both linguistic systems. The utterances spoken using the *Krama* variety by the characters in the film will shift or even lose the nuances of *krama*. This becomes interesting to study more deeply. Grounding from these premises, this research wants to examine the realization of various honorific forms as proposed by Poedjosoedarmo et.al (1979) of the Javanese language and its loss when it is transferred into Indonesian in this film. Poedjosoedarmo et al (1979) stated that Javanese language are mainly divided into *krama* (high

variety), *madya* (moderate variety), and *ngoko* (low variety).

METHOD

This research is a descriptive qualitative research in the form of a case study. Creswell (2010:4-5) asserts that qualitative research is characterized by information in the form of contextual ties that will lead to patterns or theories that will explain social phenomena. This agrees with Sutopo (2006:40) which states that in qualitative

NO	Javanese version	Indonesian Subtitle
1.	E.. <i>ngampil</i> credit card e Mas (T)	Pinjam credit card, Mas.
2.	Inggih bu (Y)	Iya bu
3.	Oh <i>sampun</i> , <i>sampun</i> , Bu. (Y)	Oh sudah , sudah, Bu.
4.	E.. <i>ngagem asma</i> lengkap to Bu? (Y)	Pakai nama lengkap semua kan, Bu?
5.	Ajeng kagem napa tho , Bu? (Y)	Mau untuk apa sih , Bu?
6.	Lemantun nopo tho , Bu? (A)	Lemari apa sih Bu?
7.	Ikli jaman Bapak esih <i>sugeng</i> , ibu ki nek nglairke kowe mboko siji tuku lemari siji	Ini saat Bapak masih hidup , Ibu itu kalau melahirkan kalian satu per satu, selalu beli satu lemari baru.
8.	Wah <i>nggih mboten</i> to Mas, kudu steril, Mas.(Y)	Wah ya tidak lah Mas. Harus steril Mas.
9.	Jaman <i>suwargi</i> eyang ki, iki dinggo nyimpen keris. (D)	Jaman eyang masih hidup , lemari ini untuk menyimpan keris.
10.	Nuwun sewu eyang nuwun sewu. (A)	Permisi , Eyang, permisi .
11.	Buk nuwun sewu kula menika dereng telpon angkutan, menawi ngaten, menawi mbenjing ngoten dos pundi? (D)	Bu, maaf saya itu belum telpon angkutan. Kalau besok saya angkutnya bagaimana?
12.	Nggih bu, mas Tri menika rak taksi wonten mriki to? (Y)	Iya bu mas Tri itu masih tinggal di sini kan?
13.	Saged dipun titipaken mas Tri lemantunipun. (Y)	Bisa dititipkan mas Tri saja lemarnya.
14.	Nggih bu mbok dititipke kula mawon bu (T)	Iya bu , dititipkan saya saja.
15.	Mangke kula terke siji-siji pun (T)	Nanti saya antarkan satu-satu lemarinya.
16.	Lajeng lemantunipun mas Tri dos pundi Bu? (A)	Lalu lemarinya mas Tri mau dibawa pulang kemana bu?
17.	Nggih Mas. (T)	Oh iya mas
18.	Nggih nggih mas.. Gampang nek niku. Mpun lak nggih beres. (T)	Iya iya Mas gampang itu. Nanti kan juga beres.
19.	Lha yen <i>ngoten kula</i> tambahane bensin sisan nggih mas nggih (T)	Ya kalau begitu , saya tambahkan bensin sekalian ya mas .
20.	Kula nyuwun pamit bu (E)	Saya pamit bu.
21.	Pamit rumiyin bu (A)	Pamit dulu bu

Table 1. forms of *krama* and its translation

research the researcher emphasizes notes with detailed, complete and in-depth sentence descriptions that describe the actual situation to support the presentation of data. Therefore, in this study, data were collected, described and analyzed in depth. The data source in this research is the 2014 short film *Lemantun* by Wregas Bhanuteja which is downloaded via Youtube

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfchZ4kfFMc>. The data is in the form of character utterances using Javanese and Indonesian subtitles. Utterances produced by all characters which involve honorific forms are categorized into data. Those utterances are generated by transcribing them into orthographic data.

The initials that representing the characters are A for Anto (the youngest son), Y for Yuni (the 4th daughter), T for Tri (the 3rd son), D for Dwi (the 2nd son), and E for Eko (the oldest son).

As the concept of *unggah-ungguh* (etiquette) the Javanese community adheres through the use of speech levels, almost all kinds of *krama* are spoken by children to their mothers and younger siblings to older siblings. However, there is also a form of respect addressed to third parties with the intention of respecting that person. More details will be described as follows.

First, *krama* level spoken by children to their mothers can be seen in data numbers 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 20 and 21, constituting 13 data. For example data number 4, "E...ngagem asma lengkap to Bu?" Yuni, the fourth child, said this to her mother when she was asked to make the names of her five children to be attached to each cupboard which would be their share according to the lottery numbers. Yuni as a child has naturally chosen *krama* to talk to her mother. This is part of Javanese etiquette during their interaction with the parents. All the children in this film select high variety when having a dialogue with their mother. Another example is the statement uttered by Dwi, the second child when Mother asked her children to immediately take their wardrobe home on the same day. This can be seen in data number 11, "Buk nuwun sewu kula menika dereng telpon angkutan, menawi ngaten, menawi mbenjing ngoten dos pundi?" when Dwi asked his mother for concessions so that his cupboard was not brought home on the

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This section describes the form of Javanese honorifics found in the film *Lemantun*. Then the findings are described and interpreted based on the context of the given speech situation.

A. The forms of Javanese honorifics in *Lemantun* movie.

The indicator of respect in the Javanese speech community is the use of *krama*. In this study, the especially Ibu's children when interacting with her. In addition, younger siblings to older siblings are also found in this variety and when talking about people to be respected. The following are the various of *krama* identified in the film.

variety of *krama* was used by several characters

same day because he needed to find and contact a freight forwarder. Here, Dwi chooses *krama* level to honor his mother. In addition, this variety is also used to persuade his mother so that the cupboard can be taken at another time, as Yuni told her mother in data (13) "**Saged dipun titipaken mas Tri lemantunipun.**" Yuni uses *krama* to convey her meaning to her mother.

Second, the variety of *krama* is also spoken by the younger sibling to the older sibling. However, the *krama* used here is not *krama inggil* but *krama madya*, a sub-type of *krama* that is looser lexically. This variety is found in data number 1, 8, 17, 18, and 19. Most of the utterances are spoken by Tri to his brothers and sisters. When he wanted to tear the paper to make a lottery paper cut, Tri borrowed his sister's credit card with the words no. 1 "e...ngampil credit card e Mas." Throughout the dialogue, Tri when interacting with her sister always uses a variety of *Krama*. Besides the age factor, social status also affects the language choice. Tri's sisters are socially higher in status. Eko, his first brother has the title of Drs, while his second brother, Dwi has the title of Ir. which both reflect bachelor degree. This confirms Tri's choice in using this speech level apart from respecting those who are older than he is. However, the variety is categorized into *krama madya* which not all, lexically, have changed. In this data, the words that have changed are *nyilih* changed to *ngampil*, while the affix *-e* which in *krama inggil* changed to *-ipun* did not change.

Besides Tri, Yuni also uses this variety when talking to her first brother, Eko, "Wah

nggih mboten to Mas, kudu steril Mas.” Yuni said this when she responded to her brother's suggestion that the cupboard could be placed in her practice as a doctor and used to store medical equipment such as stethoscopes, syringes and tensimeters. To show her disapproval she uses the option of *nggih mboten* to keep his brother comfortable. In Javanese culture, the principle of politeness during interaction is known as *nuju prana* (Poejosoedarmo, 2017: 2), namely the principle that speakers must please or make the speech partner comfortable. Consequently, expressions of disapproval or rejection are difficult for Javanese speakers to do. Even Javanese speakers prefer to avoid the word ‘no’ or express disagreement indirectly. This is what happened to Yuni when she wanted to express her disapproval of her brother's suggestion. She refused what Eko suggested because medical equipment must be placed in a sterile place. But as a younger sister, Yuni needs to comfort her brother even though she refuses. Thus, to say no, she uses the type of *krama nggih mboten* while to convey the reason, **kudu steril**, it is said through the variety of *ngoko*.

Third, the variety of *krama* is used to refer to people who are respected by speakers. The variety with this purpose is found in data 7, 9 and 10. The word 7 was spoken by Mother when she explained about the wardrobe she was going to inherit. “Iki jaman Bapak esih **sugeng**, ibu ki nek nglairke kowe mboko siji tuku lemari siji.” The word **sugeng** which means alive is used by the mother to appreciate her husband even though he had passed away. This is a form of respect from a wife to her husband. So even though the mother uses *ngoko*, anything that refers to her husband use *krama* in the word **sugeng**. This also happened when Dwi and Anto mentioned Eyang in their conversation. Dwi's statement (data 9) “Jaman **suwargi** eyang ki, iki dinggo nyimpen keris.” and Anto's utterance datum (10) “**Nuwun sewu, Eyang, nuwun sewu.**” show their respect for their late grandparents. The word **suwargi** refers to the word ‘the late’ while Anto's speech occurred when he was about to paste the paper with his name written on the cupboard he got. Since previously he was told by his brother that the cupboard was a place to store his grandparents' *keris* (Javanese traditional weapon), as a form of respect, he asked his grandparents' permission with this statement even though his grandparents had passed. The importance and strong value of respect for parents allows speech situations with a variety of choices like this to occur.

B. The Honorific Loss of Javanese-Indonesian Subtitle of *Lemantun* Movie

Subtitles are provided to help target viewers understand the messages conveyed by the players in the source language (SL). The subtitler through the translation is expected to be able to deliver messages and goals as in the SL. However, this is not an easy matter due to several challenges in subtitling including the difference in the language system between source and target language. In this film, the language used by the characters is Javanese, which recognizes the speech levels of *Krama* and *Ngoko*. This difference is identified from the lexical and grammatical choices. Meanwhile, the Indonesian language system tends to be more neutral and egalitarian so that the form of respect is not as explicitly stated as in Javanese. In addition, Indonesian does not recognize speech levels. As a result, the transfer of messages from Javanese which involves various levels of speech to Indonesian has shifted, one of which is the form of honorific.

The results of this study indicate that the form of respect cannot be accommodated by Indonesian to show the speaker's attitude towards the speech partner. Consider the following example of a conversation between Yuni and Mother.

I: Yuni,

Y: **inggih**, Bu. --> **Iya** Bu (Yes ma'am)

I: pesenanku wis tok gawe durung? --> ‘pesenan ibu sudah kamu buat belum?’

‘Have you made my order yet?’

Y: Oh, **sampun, sampun**, Bu. --> ‘oh, **sudah, sudah** Bu’ ‘oh, I have, Ma'am’

e.. **ngagem asma** lengkap to, Bu? --> ‘**Pakai nama** lengkap semua kan Bu?’

‘with fullname isn't, ma'am?’

I: he em.. --> ya ‘Yes’

Y: **Ajeng kagem napa** to Bu? --> ‘**Mau untuk apa** sih Bu’ ‘What do you want, ma'am?’

In the dialogue above, Yuni uses *krama* to talk to Mother. In Javanese, this variety is easily marked lexically such as *inggih*, *sampun*, *already*, *ngagem*, *asma*, *ajeng*, *kagem* and *napa*. However, when these utterances were translated into Indonesian, the sense of respect felt in the original version was not found in Indonesian. The word *inggih* is the *krama* form of *iyu* (iyes), but in Indonesian both are translated with the same word, namely *ya* (yes). Likewise, the word *sampun* (*krama*) from the word *uwis* (*ngoko*) is both translated with the word *sudah* (already). As a result, Yuni's attitude in maintaining

etiquette through her language behavior cannot be displayed verbally in the Indonesian subtitles. In the Indonesian subtitles, Yuni's speech looks neutral, unlike in Javanese, which has a very strong politeness aspect. However, as this is a form of audiovisual translation, it is still possible for the audience to get the message through the gestures and intonations produced by the speaker.

Another form of honorific loss is the speech used to refer to a third party as a person who deserves respect. This can be seen in the mother's speech which mentions the word *sugeng* which is translated alive and *suwargi* which is translated as the deceased. Mother would not use the word *urip* (the *ngoko* form of *sugeng* meaning alive) since it is too rude to be addressed to her husband. Instead, she chose a variety of *krama* lexeme, namely *sugeng*. This behavior is maintained and preserved even though the intended person has died. Likewise, Dwi's speech uses the word *suwargi* to refer to his late grandparents. He should respect his grandfather even though he was no longer there. Unfortunately, the linguistic behavior that is very important for the Javanese people cannot be delivered in the Indonesian subtitles.

This fact becomes a problem for subtitle translators. Differences in linguistic systems result in not all linguistic aspects being conveyed in the target language. Fortunately, the audience in enjoying the film is not only exposed to visual and acoustic verbal signs but also visual and acoustic non-verbal signs so that it is still possible to get the message that the original dialogue wants to convey.

CONCLUSION

The forms of Javanese honorifics in Javanese are identified through the speech levels, *Krama*, *Madya* and *Ngoko*. Each level of speech reflects different aspects of politeness. The form of honorific in Javanese is materialized in *krama* identified through the lexical items including *sampun*, *inggih*, *kagem*, and *napa*. When these honorific forms of film *Lemantun* is translated into Indonesian, this cannot be accommodated in the subtitled version. The differences in existing systems do not accommodate all linguistic aspects. Consequently, the honorifics is loss. Linguistic behavior is also a gap that fails to fill by Indonesian language. Fortunately, the audience in enjoying the film is not only exposed to visual and acoustic verbal signs but also visual and acoustic non-verbal signs that allows spectators to get the message that the original version wants to convey.

SUGGESTIONS

This research is still open for the exploration of non-linguistic aspects in Javanese language comparing to other language to show respect. The researcher also encourages other researcher to conduct further research about the translation failure in other languages.

REFERENCES

- Chaer, Abdul, Leonie Agustina. 2004. *Sosiolinguistik Perkenalan Awal*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Creswell, J.W. 2010. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches* (2nd Ed.). Thousands Oaks: CA: Sage
- Holmes, J. 2013. *An introduction to sociolinguistics*. (2nd Ed.). England: Pearson Education Limited.
- <https://cinemapoetica.com/lemantun-lemari-warisan-dan-malin-kundang/>. accessed on 13 April 2022.
- Lemantun. 2014. Available at <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AfchZ4kfFMc>. Accessed on 15 February 2022.
- Mediarta, A. 2007. Konfiden and the promotion of Indonesian short films. *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies*. Vol 8 (2).
- Newmark, P. 1988. *A Textbook of Translation*. London: Prentice Hall Europe.
- Poedjosoedarmo, S. 2017. Language Propriety in Javanese. *Journal of Language and Literature*. Vol 7 (1).
- Poedjosoedarmo, S. 1979. *Tingkat Tutur Bahasa Jawa*. Jakarta: Pusat Pembinaan dan Pengembangan Bahasa. Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Shuttleworth, M. and Cowie, M. 1997. *Dictionary of Translation Studies*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Spanakaki, Katia. 2007. *Translating Humor for Subtitling*. In *Translation Journal*. <http://translationjournal.net/journal/40humor.htm>.
- Sutopo. 2006. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Surakarta: UNS Press
- Suwito. 1985. *Sosiolinguistik Pengantar Awal*. Surakarta: Henry Offset Solo.

