

ANALYSIS OF THE UNTRANSLATABILITY IN DIRECT – SPEECH TRANSLATION: TOWARDS *TINTIN IN THE LAND OF SOVIETS*

Prafita Isti Wardani

S1 – Sastra Inggris
Faculty of Arts and Language
State University of Surabaya
wardaniprafita@gmail.com

Dian Rivia Himmawati

English Literature
Faculty of Arts and Languages
State University of Surabaya
dianrivia@gmail.com

Abstrak

Abstrak ini memuat tentang analisis ketidakterjemahan yang terjadi pada penerjemahan ucapan dalam Tintin di Tanah Sovyet dari Bahasa Inggris kedalam Bahasa Indonesia. Analisis ini dilakukan untuk mengetahui kemunculan ketidakterjemahan ucapan dalam penerjemahan komik populer. Tujuan dari analisis ini adalah untuk mengetahui bagaimana ketidakterjemahan penerjemahan ucapan dalam Tintin di Tanah Sovyet muncul. Analisis ini dilakukan dengan menggunakan metode kualitatif yaitu observasi sehingga data temuan dibandingkan dengan beberapa teori seperti teori penerjemahan oleh Nida dan teori ketidakterjemahan oleh Nababan. Selanjutnya, beberapa teori lain seperti tipe ketidakterjemahan oleh Beker, proses penerjemahan oleh Muchali dan komik oleh Duncan juga menjadi acuan analisis. Teori tentang cara, orientasi dan prosedur penerjemahan oleh Newmark menjadi teori utama untuk mengetahui faktor penyebab ketidakterjemahan. Setelah analisis dilakukan, ada tiga jenis ketidakterjemahan yang terjadi pada penerjemahan Tintin di Tanah Sovyet yaitu (1) konsep spesifik budaya, (2) bahasa sumber yang rumit dan (3) perbedaan penerjemahan ekspresif. Acuan penerjemah tidak dapat hilang dari konteks Bahasa Inggris. Dengan kata lain, hasil penerjemahan masih berorientasi pada Bahasa Inggris. Hasil penerjemahan tidak sesuai dengan konteks Bahasa Indonesia. Untuk menghasilkan makna yang sesuai, penerjemah seharusnya menggunakan metode penerjemahan yang berorientasi pada bahasa target. Selain itu, ucapan merupakan salah satu unit kecil dalam bahasa yang seharusnya diterjemahkan menggunakan prosedur penerjemahan dalam proses diversifikasi dan rekonstruksi. Kata kunci: Penerjemahan, Ketidakterjemahan, Ucapan, Komik.

ABSTRACT

This study investigates the untranslatability which appears in direct – speech translation towards *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* from English translation into Indonesian translation. This study was conducted because of the appearance of the untranslatability in a translated booming comic. The purpose of this study is to know how the untranslatability of direct – speech translation in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* appears. This study was conducted using observation of qualitative method to compare the data found through Nida's theory about translation and Nababan's theory about the untranslatability. Then, some related theories were used, such as: type of the untranslatability by Beker, process of translation by Muchali and comic by Duncan. Then, method, orientation and procedure of translation by Newmark were also stated to analyze some factors affected the appearance of the untranslatability. This study found that the untranslatability appears from (1) cultural – specific concept (2) SL systematically complex (3) differences in expressive meaning. The translator was not out from English translation (SL). In the other word, the orientation of the translation was emphasizing in English translation (SL). Indonesian translation (TL) produced was inappropriate. To produce an appropriate meaning, the translator has to choose method of translation which orientation is emphasizing in target language (TL). Then dealing with direct – speech as the minimal unit of language, the translator should use procedure of translation to replace English translation into Indonesian translation in diversion and reconstruction process of translation.

Keywords: Translation, Untranslatability, Direct – Speech, Comic

Introduction

Translation comes to solve people's problem who want to know some literary works which do not use their language. House (2009, p. 3) states that translation

is a replacement from an original text (SL) into another text (TL) which can be seen as a service that is used to serve people whom need to understand the world with the

language confines them. Translation is not only about the replacement of text. It takes part to mediate between language, literature and society.

The difference of variety in language sometimes appears the untranslatability unexpected in English-Indonesian translation because the translators do not only have to focus in translating between those two languages, but also they have to deal with cultural context. That is way translators have to have enough experience in translating cultural context to make TL appears as natural as SL.

An experience translator from English into Indonesian like Donna Widjajanto who has translated many literary works which are published by *Gramedia* still gets the untranslatability in translating comic dealing with culture context which can be seen in the example below.



Figure 1.1 The example of the untranslatability in English - Indonesian translation

Translation	English	Indonesian
(...)	"Don't make my mouth water, Tintin!"	<i>Jangan membuat liurku terbit, Tintin!</i>

Table 1.1 English – Indonesian translation inside linguistic images (...)

Like an example of the untranslatability above, this study analyzes direct - speech which is expressed directly between each character in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* as an object of the study. Comic is taken to know how an experience translator translates the untranslatability in direct-speech dealing with culture context from SL into target language TL.

While, the reason why this study chooses *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* as the source of data is because the comic is popular comic translated which has been translated into many languages unexpected English into Indonesian translation. For those reasons, *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* is the first comic which content tells about Soviets culture which language used is emphasizing in SL cultural context.

Based on the problem above, this study reaches two research questions. They are, 1) about how the

untranslatability of direct-speech translation in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* appears, 2) about factor affected the untranslatability of direct-speech in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

The project had three related research goals to be addressed following the importance of the research described in above section, namely: 1) To show how untranslatability of direct-speech appears from factor of translation in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*, 2) To identify factors of translation affected the untranslatability of direct-speech in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

This study uses some theories dialed with the research questions. Translation in this study refers to Nida's which states that it is a replacement of SL into TL which has to be dialed in a term of meaning and followed by style (2004: 153-167). However in translating two different languages, the translator often gets the untranslatability which language used in SL has no meaning in TL (Nababan, 1999: 93).

Each data is observed using some related theories to know about what factor affected the appearance of the untranslatability, namely: orientation of translation (Muchali, 2000: 44), method of translation (Newmark, 1998: 45) and comic (Duncan, 2004: 4). Then, each data is categorized depend on type of the untranslatability in word level (Baker, 1992: 21-26).

This study analyzes about the untranslatability which can gives come experiences how to be a good translator. Besides, the reader will learn knowledge about translation to avoid the untranslatability in translating direct - speech. It is expected to be able to provide better understanding about translation. Moreover, this study contributes a good understanding about some factors affected the appearance of the untranslatability, especially in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

RESEARCH METHOD

Descriptive qualitative approach is used for this study which reveals analysis of the untranslatability in direct – speech translation. The data found is analyzed and interpreted systematically depends on some related theories used in this study. From analyzing and interpreting, structures, patterns, and how something are become three main factors that have to be done by the researcher when doing this study (Litosseliti, 2010: 33). The researcher is as the basic instrument who can conduct this study.

The data which is analyzed in this research is direct – speech which is uttered directly by each character in *Tintin in the Land of Soviet* English – Indonesian translation. Direct – speech is taken from *Tintin in the Land of Soviet* English translation published by Pan-American and Universal Copyright Convention and

Indonesian translation published by Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

In the process of collecting data, the researcher only uses observation to collect the data. It is used in order to answer two research questions: 1) about how the untranslatability of direct-speech translation in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* appears, 2) about factor affected the untranslatability of direct-speech in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

The final part of this chapter is data analysis. It presents some steps how to analyse the data. In this case, Miles and Huberman's (1994: 10-12) data analysis model is applied. There are three steps to analyse the data. They are data reduction, data display and conclusion and verification.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Tintin in the Land of Soviets is a comic because it is told using picture. In comic, picture is generally divided into two parts: callout which shows an utterance utters by each character consider to direct – speech and picture which shows character image followed by place surrounding. Both of them cannot be separated.

Some data found in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* from English into Indonesian translation shows the untranslatability. The untranslatability in direct – speech which is uttered by each character is caused by the translator who does not find an appropriate meaning related to the pictures in Indonesian context. There are three factors influencing the untranslatability in translating *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

Method of translation

In translating, the translators can choose what method which appropriates to the literary works which are translated. Method is a way that is used by the translator to translate (Machali, 2000, p 49). There are two groups of translation method which are categorized depend on the orientation of translation (Newmark 1998, p. 45).

In this case, the translator uses method which is inappropriate to produce target language (TL) as natural as source language (SL). Most of the untranslatability identified only deal with a term of meaning, however not style of target language (TL) which has to be followed. A good translation produced has to deal with the term of meaning then followed by style although it is not identity in detail (Nida, 2004, pp. 153-167).

Three types of the untranslatability which appear in translating direct-speech of *Tintin in the Land of Soviets* belong to cultural – specific concept, systematically complex source language (SL) and differences in expressive meaning (Baker, 1992: 21-26).

Most of the appearance of the untranslatability is caused by method used by the translator to translate direct-speech of *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*.

Cultural – specific concept appears when the word of source language (SL) cannot be replaced into target language (TL) because of cultural concept. The intended words belong to customs, religious or meals' name (Nababan 1999, p. 99). Although the word “a kopek” does not refer to cultural specific concept however it cannot be replaced. If it is replaced, the atmosphere of Soviets cannot be gotten by the readers.

In cultural – specific concept, each translation is processed using literal method. All words are diverted word by word then reconstructed into Indonesian structure (Nababan, 1999: 32-33). However, the unfamiliar word is left translated such as “a kopek”. The translator has changed “a kopek” into *sekopek* in Indonesian translation. However, most Indonesian never uses the word *sekopek* to give a beggar a pity.

The word *sekopek* is chosen by the translator to stand in Soviets atmosphere. The translator uses the words naturally which belong to cultural – specific concept followed by notes, including footnote (Nababan 1999: 99). Footnote is put to give additional information dealing with the mentioned words (Nida, 1964: 237-239).

Systematically complex source language appears when the meaning of target language (TL) cannot be understood (Baker, 1992: 21-26). It does not consider to the Indonesian cultural contexts (Nababan, 1992: 22). English translation is inappropriate if it is replaced into Indonesian translation without paying attention to Indonesian cultural context.

In systematically complex source language, each translation is also processed using literal method which all words are diverted to word by word then reconstructed into Indonesian structure (Nababan, 1999: 32-33). It can be seen in translation (01) in the utterance “one of the best remedies yet discovered for curiosity” replaced into *salah satu obat terbaik yang belum ditemukan bagi rasa ingin tahu*. Indonesian translation produced by the translator still emphasizes source language (SL) (Newmark, 1998: 45).

Indonesian translation produced is difficult to be understood in Indonesian cultural context so that the untranslatability occurs. Systematically complex source language can be understood in Indonesian if it is replaced using modulation procedure in diversion and reconstruction process (Newmark, 1988: 89). There is no equivalent word in Indonesian translation although the meaning can be delivered.

Indonesian translation inside linguistic images has to be replaced into another word which is inappropriate to explain what pictorial means. To find an

appropriate meaning in Indonesian translation, modulation of translation procedures is needed. The messages both in English and Indonesian translation are similar but the translation produced is far from source language, English translation (Newmark, 1988, p. 89).

Indonesian translation inside linguistic images and pictorial means have to be considered using modulation to replace the word *Salah satu obat terbaik yang belum ditemukan bagi rasa ingin tahu* into *Ini dapat menuntaskan rasa penasaranku*. *Ini*, which means “this” in English, belongs to a boom held by a man in pictorial. In this case, *Ini dapat menuntaskan rasa penasaranku* is more appropriate to show that the man is going to use the boom to get rid his enemy of.

Differences in expressive meaning come caused by the translator cannot translate the word as expressive as source language (SL) (Beker, 1992: 21-26). Each word has prepositional meaning both in source language (SL) and target language (TL), however not in expressive meaning. In this case, expressive meaning has to be translated using deeper understanding about what is meant by each character especially in comic.

Direct-speech in comic has to be translated with showing expressive meaning to show each character's emotion mentioned in Indonesian translated as natural as English translated although they are not identity in detail (Nida 2004: 153-167). This type of the untranslatability can be seen in translation (06) in the word “great snakes”. It is replaced into *wah* which cannot show expressive meaning to swear a character that does craftiness.

In translating this type of the untranslatability, the translator uses literal and semantic method. Literal method means all words are diverted word by word then reconstructed into Indonesian structure (Nababan, 1999: 32-33). Then, semantic method is used more flexible and not depend on source language (SL) at all (see Machali, 2000: 52). However, both of them are still not appropriate used to translate. Indonesian translation produced still appears the untranslatability with context follows.

The translator has to process Indonesian translation using componential analysis (Newmark, 1988b: 83). This process is done with making sense both in English and Indonesian then looking for a new word which can represent what is meant in Indonesian.

Orientation of translation

In translating, the translators can choose what method which is appropriate to the literary works depends on the orientation of translation, emphasizing in source language (SL) or target language (TL). The selected orientation depends on for whom translation is designed (Machali, 2000: 44). Method is a way that is used by the translator to translate. There are two groups

of translation method which are categorized based on the orientation of translation, source language (SL) or target language (TL) (Newmark, 1998: 45).

In this case, the translator uses literal and semantic method in translating direct-speech of *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*. Both of them are not appropriate used to produce a good translation because the orientation produced emphasize source language (SL). Translation should be designed for Indonesian however it still refers to English which stands as a source language (SL). The meaning of Indonesian translation cannot be out of English cultural context. That is way it is difficult to be understood by Indonesian.

Only analyzing linguistic images

Tintin in the Land of Soviets belongs to comic which is a volume of fiction organized into a book using picture, which is divided into two kinds: pictorial and linguistic image (Duncan, 2009: 4). Pictorial is a part by part of picture which consists of each character and place surrounding. Pictorial cannot stand itself. It has to be followed by linguistic image which shows character's utterance.

However, the translator only analyzes linguistic images which contain direct-speech uttered by each character. Pictorial has to be considered to translate linguistic images. Not only linguistic images, but pictorial also becomes one of context follows in translating which has to be noted to build a storyline clearly. Indonesian translation produced has to show what pictorial means. In this case, most Indonesian translation produced is inappropriate to tell what pictorial means.

QUOTATIONS AND REFERENCES

The data which appears the untranslatability found is dialed with some related theories. Each related theory is used to compare the data found. Then, the bibliography dealing with each theory is included in the last part of this article to show that each theory stated is taken from reference not plagiarism.

GREATFUL

All praises belong to the almighty Allah SWT for His blessing, guidance, live and help, so that this article entitled “ANALYSIS OF THE UNTRANSLATIBILITY IN DIRECT – SPEECH TRANSLATION: TOWARDS TINTIN IN THE LAND OF SOVIETS” can be finished completely.

The writer would like to express the deep appreciation, best regard and gratitude to the advisor Mrs. Dian Rivia Himmawati, S.S., M.Hum. for her advice, motivation and patience to guide me in finishing this

article. I also would like to give regards and thanks for all people helped and supported in the process of finishing this article because without them this thesis would not be able to be accomplished. They would be:

1. Drs. Slamet Setiawan, M.A., Ph.D. as the head of English Department
2. All lecturers of English Department
3. All friends of English Literature 2010

CONCLUSION

There are some direct-speeches which appear the untranslatability produced by an experience translator in translating *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*. The untranslatability is caused by the translator who only replaces English translation (SL) into Indonesian translation without paying attention in some factors which have to be followed to produce a good Indonesian translation (TL).

Before English translation (SL) is translated, it has to be processed using process of translation: analysis, diversion and reconstruction. Analysis is done with paying attention in English translation (SL) meant. Then, the translator translates each direct – speech word by word. In reconstruction process of translation, word by word translation is reconstructed into Indonesian structure however Indonesian cultural context produced is not considered.

From process of translation, there are three factors which affect the untranslatability in translating *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*: 1) Method of translation used which belong to literal and semantic method, 2) Orientation of translation which is influenced by method designed for English translation (SL), 3) Analyzing only in linguistic images without paying attention in pictorial as the factor has to be followed in comic. That is way Indonesian translation (TL) produced is inappropriate used in Indonesian cultural context because it only deal with a term of meaning not style follows.

SUGGESTION

Based on some factors affected the untranslatability of direct – speech translation in *Tintin in the Land of Soviets*, there are some suggestions which can be used by other translators who want to translate some literary works dealing with direct – speech translation in comic. The translators should use method of translation which orientation is emphasizing in target language (TL). Dealing with comic, pictorial is considered as the significant factor. Then to find an appropriate meaning of target language (TL) considers to cultural context follows, direct – speech of source language (SL), as the minimal unit of language, has to be processed using process of translation.

For the next researchers who want to analyze the untranslatability in translating direct – speech, syntax can be included in analyzing process. Using syntax analysis, the next researchers can give more understanding about word formation which has to be considered by the translator to produce an appropriate target language (TL) dealing with meaning and style which belong to cultural context follows.

REFERENCE

- . Kopek. (2013). Retrieved April, 5th, 2014, from <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Kopek>
- (刘珏), J. L. (2013). *A Prosperous Year of the Snake* Retrieved April, 5th, 2014, from <http://www.theworldofchinese.com/2013/02/a-prosperous-year-of-snake/>
- Alison Wray, K. T., Aileen Bloomer, Shirley Reay, Christ Butler. (1998). *Project in Linguistics*. China: Edward Arnold.
- Baker, M. (1992). *In The Other Words*. New York: Routledge.
- Belovski, R. Z. (2009). *The Philosophy of the Snake* Retrieved April 5th, 2014, from <http://www.aish.com/tp/i/sms/62574167.html>
- Catford, J. C. (1965). *A Linguistic Theory of Translation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Compass, D. (2008). *Lenin's Beard*, from <http://dodgy-compass.deviantart.com/art/Lenin-s-Beard-80441452>
- Duncan, R. (2009). *The Power of Comics: History, Form and Culture*. United States of America: Library of Congress.
- Hatim, B. (2001). *Teaching and Researching Translation*. England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Hornby, A. S. (Ed.) (1948) *Advanced Learner's Dictionary (7th ed.)*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- House, J. (2009). *Translation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Hurford, J. R. (1994). *Grammar: A Student's Guide*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jacobson, R. (1959). *On Linguistic Aspect of Translation*. Cambridge: Oxford University Press.
- Joshi, M. (2013). *Direct and Indirect Speech*. Bloomington: Booktango.
- Litosseliti, L. (2010). *Research Method in Linguistic*. London: Continuum.
- Machali, R. (2000). *PedomanBagiPenerjemah*. Jakarta: Grasindo.
- McMillan, J. H. (1992). *Educational Research*. New York: Harper Collins Publisher Inc.
- Miles, M. H. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis*. California: Sage Publication Inc.
- Nababan, R. (1999). *Teori Menerjemah Bahasa Inggris*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Newmark, P. (1988b). *Approaches to Translation*. Hertfordshire: Prentice Hall.

- Newmark, P. (1998). *A Textbook of Translation*. London: Prentice-Hall.
- Nida, E. A. (1964). *Towards a science of translation, with special reference to principles and procedures involved in Bible translating*. Leiden: Brill.
- Nida, E. A. (2001). *Contexts in Translating (Vol. 41)*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Nida, E. A. (2004). *Principles of Correspondence*. London: Routledge.
- Nugroho, A. S. (2012). *Goceng, Goban, Gopek. ApaanTuh????* Retrieved April, 6th, 2014, from <http://edukasi.kompasiana.com/2012/05/02/gocek-goban-gopek-apaan-tuh-454374.html>
- Ordudari, M. (2007). *Translation Procedures, Strategies and Methods* Retrieved February 18th, 2014, from <http://translationjournal.net/journal/41culture.htm>
- Serafino, J. (2012). *The 20 Best Politician Beards and Mustaches* Retrieved April, 5th, 2014, from <http://www.complex.com/pop-culture/2012/11/20-best-politician-beards-and-mustaches/vladimir-lenin>
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Zakhir, M. (2003). *Translation Procedures* Retrieved February 25th, 2014, from <http://www.translationdirectory.com/articles/article1704.php>
- Zimboiant, M.-A. (2013). *No Grammar Tears (Vol. 3)*. Ghana: Author House.

