

## The Use of Eclectic Method to Teach Recount Text to Tenth Graders of Senior High School

Masrikhah Ningrum

English Department, Faculty of Language and Art, Universitas Negeri Surabaya.

masrikhahningrum@mhs.unesa.ac.id

### Abstrak

Berbicara tentang keterampilan membaca dan menulis, siswa mungkin mengalami kesulitan dalam menguasainya. Guru sebagai fasilitator harus memilih metode, pendekatan, atau teknik yang sesuai yang dapat membuat siswa lebih mudah memahami pelajaran, terutama dalam memahami dan menyusun teks. Salah satu caranya adalah dengan menggabungkan berbagai macam metode dalam pengajaran pembelajaran atau disebut dengan Metode Eklektik. Masalah ini mendorong peneliti untuk melakukan penelitian tentang penggunaan metode eklektik untuk mengajar teks recount kepada siswa kelas sepuluh sekolah menengah atas. Metode eklektik yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah *Scientific Approach* dan *Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition*. Penelitian ini dilakukan untuk menggambarkan penerapan metode eklektik untuk mengajarkan teks recount, pemahaman membaca siswa dan kemampuan menulis selama penerapan metode eklektik dan respon siswa terhadap penerapan metode eklektik. Desain penelitian ini adalah desain deskriptif kualitatif. Ada 19 siswa sebagai peserta dalam penelitian ini. Peneliti menggunakan catatan lapangan, rubrik pemahaman membaca, rubrik penulisan dan pedoman wawancara sebagai instrumen. Dalam menganalisis data, peneliti menganalisis tahapan guru ketika menerapkan metode eklektik berdasarkan pengamatan. Kemudian, pemahaman membaca dan tugas menulis siswa dianalisis berdasarkan hasil wawancara. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa dengan menggunakan metode ini, siswa dapat memperoleh soft skill dan hard skill.

**Kata kunci:** Pemahaman Membaca, Penulisan, Metode Eklektik, Pembacaan dan Komposisi Koperasi Terpadu, Pendekatan Ilmiah, Teks Recount

### Abstract

Talking about reading and writing skill, students might have difficulties to master it. Teacher as the facilitator should choose the appropriate method, approach or technique that can make the students easier to understand the lesson, particularly in comprehending and composing text. One of the ways is by combining various kinds of methods in teaching learning or called as Eclectic Method. This problem encourages the researcher to conduct a research about the use of eclectic method to teach recount text to tenth graders of senior high school. Furthermore, the eclectic methods used in this research are *Scientific Approach* and *Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition*. This study was conducted to describe the implementation of eclectic method to teach recount text, the students' reading comprehension and writing ability during the implementation of the eclectic method and the students' responses towards the implementation of the eclectic method. The design of this study was a descriptive qualitative design. There were 19 students as the participants in this study. The researcher used field notes, rubric of reading comprehension, rubric of writing and interview guidelines as the instrument. In analyzing the data, the researcher analyzed the teacher's stages when implementing the eclectic method based on the observation. Then, students' reading comprehension and writing task were analyzed based on the reading comprehension rubric and the writing rubric. Next, students' responses were analyzed based on the result of the interview. The result showed that by using this method, students could gain both the soft skill and hard skill.

**Keywords:** *Reading Comprehension, Writing, Eclectic method, Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition, Scientific approach, Recount Text*

### INTRODUCTION

In learning English there are four skills that should be mastered by the students. These are listening, speaking, reading and writing. Listening skill is integrated with speaking skill while reading skill is integrated with writing skill. These skills form a strong relationship. All those skills are important to assist them in communication both in oral and written. Talking about

written communication, reading and writing play an important role as a tool. Therefore, to make the teaching of English to be successful, those skills should be integrated each other. In this case, students need opportunities to develop their reading and writing skills. As stated by Hsu (2004), language teacher should ask their students to write the text they have read and give the response to it so that students understand about the text they recently read. Furthermore, he also stated that

writing means relating our prior knowledge with the new information that we just now grasp by reading a text.

In 2013 Curriculum, senior high school students, especially at the tenth grade concern on three types; descriptive, narrative and recount text. Students should also be able to master those three texts. At the second semester, especially students of tenth grader have begun to learn about recount text.

According to based competency number 4.7 in 2013 curriculum about recount text, students should be able to comprehend contextually about recount text and also compose a short and simple oral and written recount text. However, in the learning process of recount text, many students still have difficulties in comprehending the text and it can make them difficult in composing the text. It can be known when the teacher gives some quizzes, only few students can answer the questions. It happens because sometimes the students do not know about the vocabulary/lack of vocabularies so that they have difficulties in understanding the sentences. Sometimes the teacher also only focuses on monotonous learning style. All those problems might guide the students to lack motivation in learning process that make them inactive in the class. Furthermore, teaching is not easy, so the teacher should choose the method that could assist the students in learning process. There are various kinds of teaching methods that can be applied in the class. Every teaching method has different strengths and weaknesses, as stated by Larsen & Freeman (2000:182) that a method is not always successful for each student. Students also have different backgrounds with various experiences in learning English and it shows that the students might have diverse problems in comprehending the text. Based on the background of the study, the researcher tries to apply Eclectic method. In accordance with *Panduan Pembelajaran Untuk Sekolah Menengah Pertama* the book made by the ministry of education and culture 2016, eclectic method is the combination of two or more methods by selecting the best features from each method to create a better instruction. The teacher might combine the methods depend on the basic competence, the material, the time allocation, the availability of the facility and other aspects.

In teaching recount text the approach and technique combined in this research were Scientific Approach and Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC). Based on 2013 curriculum, the teaching learning process is centered to the students and it requires the students actively involved in the learning process. One of the approaches parallel to this teaching approach is scientific approach. While, Durukan (2011) stated that CIRC is a technique that can be used for reading, writing and other language skills. So, the teacher

implements those methods because it could meet the teacher demand in teaching learning process. The similar study of Eclectic Method application has been conducted by Suparman (2017). The aim of the study was to examine the effectiveness of eclectic method to improve students' writing skill at the eighth grade students of Junior High School. The study was experimental research in which Grammar Translation Method was combined with *Pelatihan Terintegrasi Berbasis Kompetensi* technique. The result of the study showed that eclectic method was significantly effective to be implemented in English writing class to improve student writing skill. From those explanation and previous study related, the researcher attempts to find out whether the implementation of eclectic method (SA and CIRC) could meet the teacher demand in teaching recount text, particularly in reading and writing skill for tenth graders of senior high school in Mojokerto. Therefore, the objectives of the study are to describe:

1. The way the teacher implements Eclectic method in teaching recount text to the tenth graders of senior high school.
2. The students reading comprehension and writing ability during the implementation of Eclectic method in teaching recount text to the tenth graders of senior high school.
3. The student's responses toward the implementation of Eclectic method in teaching recount text to the tenth graders of senior high school.

### Research Methodology

This study used qualitative design. According to Ary (2010), qualitative research is a research designed to understand a phenomenon in depth. This study worked with one of the English teachers and one class of tenth graders as the research subjects. The observation was done in three weeks consists of three times observation. In collecting the data, the researcher observed teaching and learning activity by sitting at the back of the class. Then, providing the students some exercises in the class. The students were given exercises about reading comprehension questions of the text they have read. Then, Students composed their recount text individually. Students also cooperated with their group to edit and revise each other text. Furthermore, the researcher also interviewed some students. In this section, the researcher did the interview when the observation was done. The researcher interviewed nine students as the representative. In choosing the interviewee, the researcher used purposive sampling method that allows her to select and choose the subject based on what is needed by the researcher to achieve the research

objective (Ary, 2010). The data used were teacher verbal and nonverbal activity during the teaching learning process in the class, student assignment result in reading and writing and students' interview result. The instruments used by the researcher were observation field notes, rubric of reading comprehension and rubric of writing, and also interview guidelines. In analyzing the qualitative data, the researcher read and reread the data such as field notes, interview result and other data. Then, it transcribed without changing the language and the words in order to avoid bias. Then, the researcher organized all the information to make it easier to be analyzed. The researcher coded the data and reduced unimportant information. Next, the researcher explained and discussed the result of the research descriptively.

making a table and classifying it.

- Teacher asks students to write down what they found on the paper in group.
- Students write down what they found on the paper.

Moving to the next phase, the teacher introduced what they were going to learn. The teacher showed the video related to recount text which was The Battle of Surabaya. The students observed the video by watching it together. They looked interested in the video and curious about the story. After watching the video, the teacher gave some questions about what they have observed such as what the video was about, when the video took place and why it happened. Next, the teacher showed the power point of recount text but before showing the slide, the teacher asked about the definition, the purpose, the generic structure and also the language features of recount text. Students were also asked to answer the questions by raising their hand.

Moved to next slide, the teacher explained about series of events, reorientation and also the language features. Afterwards, the teacher tried to divide the class into 6 groups. The teacher asked the students to gather with their group then the teacher began to explain the next step. The teacher gave a piece of paper consists of two texts to every group. Then, they were asked to identify the texts given in group such as the purpose, generic structure, language features of the text. The teacher asked two groups who had finished presenting their work in front of their friends.

Before the teacher ended the class, she repeated and concluded the material they have learnt.

(b) Second Meeting  
The teacher started the lesson by greeting the students and checking the attendance list.

Moving to the next phase, the teacher began the lesson by reviewing the lesson they learnt last week. Here were the stages of the eclectic method that should be followed by the teacher.

**Result and Discussion**

**The Result of The Observation**

(a) First Meeting

The teacher started the lesson by greeting the students and checking the attendance list. Here were the stages of the eclectic method used by the teacher.

**Table 1. The Use of Eclectic Method to Teach Recount Text**

<b>Stages of Eclectic Method (Scientific Approach and Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition)</b>
<b>Observing</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Teacher introduces what students will learn.</li> <li>○ Students listen to the teacher's explanation.</li> <li>○ Teacher shows a video related to the topic.</li> <li>○ Students observe the video showed by the teacher.</li> </ul>
<b>Questioning</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Teacher guides students to make question towards what they are observing.</li> <li>○ Students ask questions related to video they have observed.</li> </ul>
<b>Collecting Data</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Concept Recognition Phase</b></li> <li>○ Teacher gives some explanation about what they have observed.</li> <li>○ Students listen to the teacher explanation.</li>   <li>• <b>Exploration and Application</b></li> <li>○ Teacher gives the passage to the students related to the topic.</li> <li>○ Teacher asks students to analyze the passage given in group.</li> <li>○ Students in group identify the passage.</li> <li>○ Students in group process the data collected by</li> </ul>

**Table 1. The Use of Eclectic Method to Teach Recount Text**

<b>Associating</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Exploration and Application</b></li> <li>○ Teacher gave the same passage to the students.</li> <li>○ Teacher asks students to answer some questions related to the passage in group.</li> <li>○ Students do the task in group.</li> </ul>
<b>Communicating</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Teacher asks the students to communicate their answers in group.</li> <li>○ Students communicate their answers in group.</li> </ul>

The teacher asked the students to move their seat and gathered with their group. Then, the teacher shared the task that contains two same texts as the last meeting and some questions related to the text. Next, the teacher asked them to answer it in group and discuss with their group. Then, the teacher also asked the group who had finished presenting their work again.

Time was almost over. Before ending the class, the teacher ensured the students again whether they have collected their task or not. Next, she also told the activity that they would do for the next meeting.

(c) Third Meeting

The teacher started the lesson by greeting the students and checking the attendance list.

Moved to the next phase, the teacher prepared all the materials for the writing task then she made sure that the students have brought their own dictionary. The teacher also made sure that the students had sat on their own chair and did not sit with their group member. Here were the stages of the eclectic method that should be followed by the teacher.

**Table 1. The Use of Eclectic Method to Teach Recount Text**

<b>Creating</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Teacher asks the students to compose their own recount text individually.</li> <li>○ Students write their own text individually.</li> <li>○ Teacher asks the students to cooperate in revising their composition with group members.</li> <li>○ Students revise each other composition with group member.</li> </ul>
<b>• Publication</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Teacher asks the group to present their work in front of the class.</li> <li>○ Students present their work in front of the class.</li> </ul>

In this task, the students were not working in group so they should sit separately with their group because they did an individual task. Next, the teacher told about the rules for the writing task. In this case, the teacher had prepared 6 different envelope themes for each group. One envelope consists of three up to four same clues. Then, the teacher called the representative of the group members to take the envelope and asked them to share it with their friends in group. After sharing the clue to their group members, they should back to their own desk and do the task individually. Time was over and the teacher asked them to finish their work and gathered again with their group. Then, the teacher shared peer editing form to them and asked them to check their friends work. After filling peer editing form, the students collected all their work to the teacher.

In the end of the class, the teacher asked some questions about the activity they did. Based on the result of the observation, it showed that the implementation of the eclectic method could be seen from the teaching learning activity during the class. The teacher applied the eclectic method began from the stage of collecting the data combined with concept recognition phase and exploration and application phase, associating step combined with exploration and application phase and creating step combined with publication phase.

**2. The Results of Students Reading Task**

In the second meeting, students were given reading comprehension task that should be done in group. There were two different texts; the first text was □The Battle of Surabaya and the second text was □Meeting My Idol□. Every text consists of ten reading comprehension questions and the amount of all the questions were twenty. In this case, the students were given the tasks to answer all the questions with their group member. Based on the result, all group could answer fifteen to eighteen questions correctly.

**3. The Result of Student writing Task**

In the third meeting, students were given writing task which should be done individually. The researcher had analyzed the students work based on the elements of writing adapted from Jacob et al. The elements that the researcher analyzed were content, organization, vocabulary, language use and mechanics. As the result, there were three students got excellent to very good, ten students got good to fair and five students got poor.

**4. The Students Response on the Use of Eclectic Method in Teaching Recount Text**

In this part, the researcher used structured interview because it could maintain the consistency of information in the interview when there were multiple interviewers included. The researcher has prepared ten detailed questions in which the questions were pre-decided. As the result, students gave different opinion and various responses to the questions.

**Discussion**

**1.The Implementation of Eclectic Method to Teach Recount Text to the Tenth Graders of Senior High School**

The teacher had applied most of the implementation of the eclectic method in accordance with its approaches and stages offered in SA and CIRC. However, the teacher had missed the step of Questioning in SA and Publication phase in CIRC. Nonetheless, the implementation of the eclectic method could make the

teacher easier to understand every single person well and to develop group communication. Besides, it also provides benefit for the students to cooperate with their group and develop the individual skill both in reading and writing.

## **2. The Result of Students' Reading Comprehension during the Implementation of Eclectic Method in Teaching Recount Text**

Based on the average scores of reading comprehension task, all groups were categorized into good level because they could answer fifteen up to eighteen questions correctly and their scores were included in the criteria of good level. It means the students could pass the minimum score. Therefore, it can be concluded that the students could understand the information in the text. It is also in line with Brassel and Rasinski (2008:18), they stated that reading comprehension is an ability to grasp the information from the written text.

## **3. The Result of Students' Writing Ability during the Implementation of Eclectic Method in Teaching Recount Text**

Considering to the rubric's criteria, some of students successfully fulfilled each point. The excellent to very good level recount text had quite satisfying content, organization, vocabulary, mechanism and grammar. The content of those recount text were informative and knowledgeable. The students also had quite good background knowledge to develop their writing. Furthermore, some students tried to add re-orientation as their opinion. Next, the good to fair level made mistakes in the content, grammar, vocabulary and mechanism. In this case, the content of the students writing result had limited development of the clues given. The students need to add more detail information for the series of events. Furthermore, there were some unsuitable vocabulary uses that made the meaning unclear. Then, the poor writing were far below the excellent to very good level. Most of the students had difficulties in the content. They could not develop the clue given because they lack of background knowledge. Most of them arranged and rewrote the clues without giving their ideas.

## **4. The Result of Students' Responds towards the Implementation of Eclectic Method in Teaching Recount Text**

Based on the results of the interview, the students have various answers toward the implementation of eclectic method in teaching recount text. Most of the students have positive answers towards the

implementation of the method. According to the data sample represented by 9 students, it showed that most of them liked to learn collaboratively with their friends because they could discuss and help each other. Furthermore, they also said that it made them easier to do their task in reading comprehension. However, they also have some difficulties during the implementation of this method such as developing the ideas for writing and also lack of background knowledge. They also said that this method needs more fun learning because they felt it was a little bit boring.

In short, based on the interview this method could make the students easier in comprehending the reading text for the reading skill. It also provides some advantages such as cooperation, solidarity, inter-group communication, and also self-responsibility. However, for the writing skill, it could only help some students, it is because most of the students still lack of background knowledge. Therefore, this method still needs more evaluation on its application in the class.

## **Conclusion**

From the observation, the researcher can conclude that the implementation of the eclectic method to teach recount text is relevant to the theory and stages offered in the use of eclectic method (Scientific Approach (SA) and Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC)). Even though the teacher missed some steps in the learning process, the core steps of the lesson for reading and writing ran as what the teacher intended.

Then, from the results of the students' reading comprehension task, it showed that the student could comprehend the text given. The students could discuss and communicate with their group to answer the questions.

Next, from the results of the students' writing result, it showed that this method could only assist some students in writing process. Most of the students still get difficulties on the students' background knowledge. Therefore, the researcher concludes that this method still needs more evaluation for its application for the writing skill.

Moreover, looking at students' responses towards the implementation of the eclectic method, nearly all of them agree that this method could make students easier in comprehending the reading text. They also said that it could strengthen the solidarity, cooperate with others, train their skill both in reading and writing and also enrich their knowledge. However, some of them also said that they still have difficulties to develop the writing because of lacking the background knowledge. Even though the students have some difficulties, in

general, it can be seen that most of the students still have positive responses to this method.

### Suggestions

For high school teachers, it is important for them to know the student's needs, especially for reading and writing skills in recount text. They should find various methods, techniques or approaches that could be implemented in the class. The implementation of the eclectic method could be the alternative to teach recount text. Furthermore, it will also train the student's soft skill and hard skill.

For future researchers, if they want to conduct the same research, it is better for them to use other approaches, techniques or strategies for the eclectic method. They can also use other skills and kinds of texts. Therefore, the next researchers can find something fresh in order to modify this method and give another contribution towards teaching learning process.

### REFERENCES

- Alyousef, H. S. (2005). *Teaching Reading Comprehension to Esl/Efl Learners*. The Reading Matrix, 143-154.
- Anderson, D. (2000). *Teaching & Principles in Language Teaching*.
- Ary, D. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education*. Wadsworth: Cengage Learning.
- Durukan, E. (2011). Effects of Cooperative Integrated Reading and Composition (CIRC) technique on reading-writing skills. *Academic Journals*, 102-109.
- Harmer, J. (2001). *The Practice of English Language Teaching*. Longman.
- Hsu, J. (2004). *Reading, Writing, and Reading-Writing in the Second Language Classroom :A Balanced Curriculum*.
- Kebudayaan, K. P. (2016). *Panduan Pembelajaran untuk Sekolah Menengah Pertama*. Jakarta: Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan.
- Kothary, C. (2004). *Research Methodology*. New Delhi: New Age International.
- Kumar, C. P. (2013, June). The Eclectic Method- Theory and Its Application to The Learning of English. *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(6)
- Rasinski, D. B. (2008). *Comprehension That Works*. Huntington Beach: Shell Education.
- Suparman. (2017). The effectiveness of eclectic method in teaching writing english of recount text for eight grade students of smpn 1 keruak. *Palapa*, 43-60.
- The Eclectic Method- Theory and Its Application to the Learning of English. (2013). *International Journal of Scientific and Research Publications*, 3(6).
- Ula, M. Z. (2018). The Implementation of Eclectic Method in Teaching Writing Recount Text. *RETAIN*, 126-134.

