

## Teacher's Written Feedback for the Student's Writing of Narrative Text

**Yola Maziatus Saffanah**

English Department, Language and Art Faculty, Universitas Negeri Surabaya  
[yolasaffanah@mhs.unesa.ac.id](mailto:yolasaffanah@mhs.unesa.ac.id)

### Abstrak

Menulis bahasa Inggris adalah hal yang sering terasa sulit yg dipelajari siswa dalam belajar bahasa Inggris sebagai bahasa kedua. Siswa terkadang menghadapi banyak masalah dalam mengeksplorasi ide-ide dan menemukan kata yang tepat untuk ditulis. Dalam penelitian ini peneliti berfokus pada guru yang memberikan masukan kepada siswa dalam mengajar teks naratif di kelas sepuluh Sains 1 MAN 1 Kota Mojokerto. Berdasarkan analisis Guru memberikan beberapa tanda dalam tulisan teks naratif. Setelah itu dia memberikan masukan tertulis dengan menggunakan lingkaran dan garis bawah di dalam pekerjaan siswa. Dalam penelitian ini guru mendapat kesulitan untuk memberikan masukan kepada siswa. Terutama dalam kosakata, tata bahasa dan tingkat siswa. Siswa masih bingung untuk menggunakan kata-kata yang tepat dan struktur teks. Dapat disimpulkan bahwa masukan tertulis guru dapat membantu siswa menulis teks naratif lebih baik dan membuat mereka tahu cara untuk memperbaiki kesalahan mereka dalam menulis naratif dengan mudah.

**Kata Kunci:** *menulis, masukan dalam menulis, masalah guru, teks narasi.*

### Abstract

Writing is an English skill which is often felt difficult to learn by the students especially for the student who learn English as second language. The students usually face many problems in exploring the ideas and finding correct words to write. The researcher focuses on the teacher give the students feedback in teaching narrative text to the tenth grades Science 1 of MAN 1 Kota Mojokerto. Based on the data analysis, the teacher gave some signs in their written work of narrative. She gave written feedback by using circle and underlining on the students' work. In this study, the teacher got the difficulties to give the students feedback. Especially in vocabularies, grammar and level of students. They still confused to use the right words and the structure. It could be concluded that teacher's writing feedback helps the students write a narrative text better. It makes them know the way to correct their mistakes in writing narrative easily.

**Keywords:** *writing, writing feedback, teacher problems, a narrative text.*

## INTRODUCTION

Many students in Indonesia think that English is difficult skill to be understood because the English teacher usually teaches in a boring situation, so the students cannot enjoy during studying English. Writing is an English skill which is often felt difficult to learn by the students especially for the student who learn English as second language. It is important for the teachers provide a teaching method that makes the students enjoy during teaching and

learning process. It supported by Richards and Renandya (2002:303) who stated that writing is considered as the most difficult skill for the students because it is not only in term of organizing and generating ideas but also about translating these ideas into printed word that can be readable. The students also need to have good L2 background knowledge about the words choice; appropriate grammar, punctuation and organization ideas in order to explain the message of that written and

make the readers can understand well what the writer's ideas are.

Writing should be practiced and learned continuously so the students can master it well. It takes time to be able to write. It needs some guidance and sustained practices (Cantony and Harvey, 1987:81). From the stamen above, the student should practices to write a composition and paragraph in a narrative text continuously to make them have good writing. When the students want to make writing well it takes time to practice and also they need some written feedback from the teacher providing feedback in a second language is integral to develop students' writing skills (Herrera, 2011:45). Students need feedback and comments to facilitate them in composing their writing with minimal errors as well during writing process. Therefore English teachers, they are expected to be able helps the students to overcome the problem that faced in writing.

Writing feedback is taken to provide an instruction the teacher. In this process the teacher reads the students' work and response to give several comments. Thus, according to Askew and Lodge (2000:5) feedback is one way communications from a teacher to the student to provide information for helping the students learn. On the other hands, she tries to give more specific explanation about the student written work to simulate the student 'courage when giving feedback. It means that the teacher should give feedback to the students after the students finishing their work. It can motivate them to be better in writing narrative text to know their mistakes. Teacher feedback has an influence on the students writing ability. Therefore, if the teacher didn't give the students any feedback in the writing process, they wouldn't know and understand about their mistakes in writing narrative text. It makes them keep on committing the same errors for the next time. Those difficulties that student often do is the students in first grade could not enjoy writing because they do not understand how to write narrative text correctly based on the elements of writing, language features and generic structure. Additionally, feedback is helpful in encouraging students not to consider what they write as a final product and in helping them to write and revise their

writing several times in order to produce a much improved piece of writing.

A narrative text is only text-type which is learned in every grade of senior High School level. This text considered to have higher level of difficulties and confusion because there are one more than text-type which almost has similar generic structure and language feature, such as recount text, , anecdote, spoof and explanation text ( Rosyidah,2009:4). It has several aspect, such as: material sign, the meaningful discourse, the interesting story, and social function. The social function of narrative text can be cultural values, a crisis point in problem of story and also the way to behave and solve the problems.

According to the result of the study conducted by the researchers above, teacher feedback has an influence on the students writing. Therefore, if the teacher did not give the students' any feedback in the writing process, they would not know and understand about their mistakes in the writing narrative text. It makes them keep on committing the same errors.

There are some previous that have been done in the field of feedback. Gee (1989) in his research conducted experimental research about the effect of positive feedback and no feedback on two groups in teaching writing narrative text for senior high school students. It shows that there was a substantial different in terms of the ability between the two groups; the researcher indicated that the students who received positive feedback were developed better in writing attitudes than those who did not receive feedback.

Research above only focuses the result of the student's feedback. However they did not mention how to implement feedback correctly and the problems during giving feedback. The aim of this research is to analyze how the teacher gives feedback in students' written especially in narrative text and how the teacher problems giving feedback in narrative text. The problem to be investigated is "To what extend is teacher giving feedback in narrative text?

Based on the background of study above, the research questions are elaborated as follows;

1. How does the teacher give the written feedback for the students writing in narrative text?

2. What is the teacher's problem while giving feedback in narrative text?

## RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study is design to be a descriptive qualitative. It is to describe situation and happenings in the teaching and learning process in the classroom using word. According to McMillan (1992:27), qualitative research for particular setting under study because it is concerned with context. The reason why the researcher choose descriptive qualitative because, the researcher want to observe the teacher's activities in the classroom. How they get involved in the teaching and learning process in writing a narrative text when teacher's feedback is given.

The subject of this study is the English teacher who taught and gave feedback in first grade Science 1 in MAN 1 Kota Mojokerto. She was chosen because she has good competence in writing. The teacher also already confirmed that she always give feedback to her students.

In this research, the researcher used two kinds of instruments. They were interviews questions, and the field notes. Each of the instruments was used for gaining different data as a additional instruments of this study.

Firstly, interview provides information that cannot be gained by observation or used for analysis of varieties. The interview was formed in semi-structured interview. This type of interview has guidelines which is helpful to focus on what the researcher need to know. At the same time, this type of interview is flexible because more questions can be delivered regarding to the problem of the research. It is also more conversational and interviewer has more freedom to arrange to order of the questions. .

Secondly, The researcher used field note to write down all of the important things that she had seen and happen during teaching and learning process. The observation include teacher and students action and implementation of feedback in narrative text, such as social function, generic structure and language feature. McMillan, (1992:219) state that field notes are detailed written descriptions of what was observation and constituted the raw data that the writer analyzed to address the research problems.

Filed note use to get the whole description about the activities in the class.

After collecting the data, the researcher did the analysis and interpretation of the data that have been collected. According to Ary, et.al (2010), there are three stages of analyzing qualitative data. They are organizing and familiarizing, coding and reducing, and interpreting and representing. These stages were applied in this study.

## RESULT

### Teacher's written feedback for the students' writing of narrative text.

This part focused on the data collection based on three days observation in XIPA 1 of MAN 1 Kota Mojokerto. From each meeting held for 45x2 minutes. The teacher made three sections in this class; pre-teaching, whilst-teaching and post teaching.

In teaching narrative text the researcher describe the result of the teacher's written feedback. This part was to describe how the teacher gave written feedback on the students' works as a purpose

Based on the observation, the researcher found that the students made several mistakes. The topic is about "Aladdin". There were many errors of word form usage such as; long ago, disturb, was told, outside and trap. It could be seen that there were still had mistaken from the student's works, especially in word choice and verb. From the student's mistakes the, teacher gave some feedback by using red circle to inform that students have wrong words or tenses. After that, the students not mention all of the participant of the story, for example in each paragraph they did not make a clear meaning, such as; Ms. Aladdin allowed Aladdin to leave in hopes of earning a lot of money, Aladdin will threatened to in killed, genie to take him home to the pit with his mother. So the teacher gave the feedback by using underline and the (?). It means that the teacher did not understand the students mean of that sentences. After gave the feedback, the teacher took a look the generic structure. Based on that story, the students still cannot improve the ideas, vocabulary and build the concept to develop the story in narrative text. And there were some sentences still written in Indonesia form. The criteria of organization of the students' writing was based on the completeness of

generic structures and quality, logic and how fluent of the students' writing was. In writing narrative text, it should consist of the generic structures of the text. They were: orientation, complication and resolution.

The teacher found many verbs still in present forms, for examples: live, eat, are, is and etc. most of the students used verb past tense. In this meeting could be conclude that the students' writing was clear in meaning, the students also had divided the part of generic structure clearly, but there were one students who describe the complication clearly. It was shown from the extract four. The students did not give the clear complication and the solving problem.

The researcher still found few mistakes from students that have been categories good in the class. Most of the student used simple present tense in a narrative text. From the examples some of students understood in the last meeting. She still found words which were translated word by word into English, for example: The Golden Cucumber. It showed that the students had limited knowledge about the vocabulary of writing. The teacher gave them feedback by using underline and circles the words and (?) for the students that made unclear meaning in the sentences.

After that all of the students had to understand that mistakes after that the teacher gave them feedback. The students knew their mistakes and changed it into correct form. Most of students already in the same level. Thus teacher was easier to give them feedback. The students looked enjoy and did not find any confusion in this meeting. They are motivated because by giving teacher's feedback could make them easily to write narrative text and new their mistakes, especially about the tenses, so the teacher saw the progress in their composition of narrative text and she gave them the feedback based on the student's understanding in the last meeting.

### **The Teacher Problem Giving Feedback in Narrative Text**

This section is to answer the second research question. The researcher found English teachers' problems during teaching and learning English process. Those problems were often found by an English teacher in teaching writing in ten grades of

MAN 1 Kota Mojokerto. According to the interview, the problems were vocabularies, grammar and level of students. The problems for the vocabularies and grammar, the students have limited vocabulary so they could not make a sentence correctly. The, from the different level the students could not implement their writing ability to make a narrative text. The students confused to choose the right words and correct the generic structure of the sentence. The teacher did not teach when delivered feedback with the process of writing narrative text. Teacher gave sign in wrong words and underlining for unclear meaning. She did not give direct feedback because she want the students find the mistakes by themselves.

### **DISCUSSION**

Narrative text is texts that exist tell about fiction story. The function is used to entertain or amuse with problematic events which lead to crisis or turning point of some kind, which in turn find a resolution (BSNP, 2003, p.49)

In the first meeting the teacher tried to review about narrative text. She did not give the works first because she wanted to make the students understood about narrative text. In this meeting there is no feedback because haven been scheduled. The result of the first meeting, the researcher knew that the most of students did not have a good understanding about a narrative text. They were still confused to use kind of words and verbs that used in narrative text. The students did not know how to change the present tense form into past tense form because it was the first meeting. Furthermore the teacher asked to them to identify a narrative text based on the generic structure and language feature of narrative text to make them understood well. Then the teacher also asked them to write a narrative text based on the topic that given by her. Before the end of the class the teacher gave reflection by asking question that related to the materials.

In the second meeting, the teacher asked them to write a narrative text with the topic that given by teacher is about 'Aladdin'. After that she gave the written feedback the teacher understood some of students still confused wrote the formula of simple past tense. If the students did know the past tense

form of certain verbs, she suggests them to look up it in a dictionary.

After the teacher asked them to rewrite their composition based on the teacher's feedback, they were very active and interested in doing writing test because the result of feedback could help them in writing a narrative text, but they have been trained. So the teacher has not got feedback.

In the third meeting, the teacher reviewed the materials in the previous meeting. Then she asked the students to write a narrative text again. The teacher always gives the interesting topic like a Timun Mas. All of the students looked enthusiastic because they had known that story. The teacher thought that was a good idea to increase the student's motivation in writing a Narrative text. After finishing their writing, the teacher gave them written feedback on the student's works one by one.

The student's writing were analyzed by 4 items, they are content, organization, vocabulary and language use. In the first meeting, the tasks were given to check the students' understanding in narrative text, but at this meeting the teacher had not been given feedback to the students. It only to check the student understands in narrative text. So the researcher only discussed the result of students' writing a narrative text in the second and third meetings where the teacher's written feedback had been given to the students' work. In the second and third meeting was done individually.

In the term of content there are many students who getting very good level from this meeting, where the teacher's feedback was given and the student wrote individually, the result of their writing are god good level are 8 students, 8 students got fair leer and then 13 students god poor level in term of organization, the students' writing ability in organizing the paragraph improved ; the student's understand more about how to write narrative text and can improve their ideas ( orientation, complication and resolution). In term of vocabulary some of students can use the appropriate words. Lastly in the language use, there were a few students who get very good level. The students got still confused to use appropriate action verb in contrasting simple present tense. In this meeting the students can wrote narrative text individually

So the students could understand the written feedback easily. The teacher conducted three steps of writing; pre-writing, whilst writing and post writing (Tompkins 1994). The teacher gave the indirect written feedback by giving underline, circle and words choices (Ellis, 2009). In this meeting the students looked understandable. They could follow the teacher's written feedback very well. They were understood and motivated because the teacher's written feedback could make them could write well than before in a narrative text. The student's writing a narrative text in third meeting became more correctly

Narrative text is texts that exist tell about fiction story. The function is used to entertain or amuse with problematic events which lead to crisis or turning point of some kind, which in turn find a resolution (BSNP, 2003, p.49).

Based on the interview, the teacher has difficulties in giving feedback of narrative text. Such as, the students did not understand well about vocabularies, grammar and the level of students' ability. This is in line with statement from Setiawan et al. (2014) who stated that students' difficulties in grammar can be known from the students work after the teacher gave task. Beside the teacher found many mistakes in vocabularies while the teacher correcting the students' works. The students do not know how to convert verb one to verb two.

In other side, there were some students that could not work fast and good understanding in writing. The teacher could not give task the same as with the student who has the higher level, because it could pressure those students. In this situation, teacher feels hard to give the materials based on their level. According to Hamilton (2006), Teacher often complaints about the low level of their learners in learning English language skill, this may be due to such internal factor as the motivation level. So she did not teach when delivered feedback with the process of writing narrative text.

## CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

From the analysis in a previous chapter, it can be concluded that the teacher writing feedback can help the student to write narrative text. The teachers identify a narrative text based on the generic structure and language feature to make them



understood well. Then she also gave some signs in their written work of narrative text based on the topic that given by her. After that she gave the written feedback by using circle and underlining on the students' work. The teacher understood some of students still confused to write the formula of simple past tense. The last stage the teacher reviewed the materials in the previous meeting. Then she asked the students to write a narrative text again. The teacher always gives the interesting topic.

The teacher has difficulties in giving feedback of narrative text. The teacher cannot give the same feedback because the students did not understand well about vocabularies, grammar and the level of students' ability. She also confused to give direct feedback, because some of them feel difficult in grammar that can be known from the students work. Beside the teacher found many mistakes in their work while the teacher correcting the students' works.

The research can also explore their study by opening kind of oral and written feedback. To make it more effective and useful, but this study mostly used written feedback and the teacher should pay attention to all of the students during learning and teaching process. Some of them did not understand well about form of narrative text yet. It must to English teacher to be more thinkable during the process to teach writing skill because the students have different level ability. Some of students who sit in the back are not given enough attention. It is better for the teacher should always give motivation and reward to the students to make them more enjoy.

## REFERENCES

- Ary, D., Jacobs, L., Sorensen, C., & Razaivieh, A. (2006). *Introduction to Research in Education Eight Edition*. Canada: Wadsworth.
- Askew, S. D., & Lodge, C. (2000). *Gift, ping-pong and loops-linking feedback and learnin*. USA: Routledge Falme
- BSNP. (2003). *Standar Kompetensi Matma Pelajaran Bahasa Inggris SMA Dan MA in kurikulum 2004*. Jakarta: Depdiknas

Cantony & Harvey. (1987). *A Practice Guideline: An Essay to Write*. New York: Prentice Hall regents.

Gee, K. (1989). The Study of Teachers' Written Feedback to Students Writing: Changes in Theoretical Consideration and the Expansion of Research Contexts. *Instructional Science*, 18, 145-165.

Herrera, S. L. (2011). *Exploring the Role of Corrective feedback in Second Language Writing*. Department of Language and Literacy Education, University of British Columbia.

Hamilton, S. S. (2006). Evaluation of children with reading difficulties. *American Family Physician*, 74(12), 2079-2084

McMillan, J. H. (1992). *Educational Research, fundamental for consumer*. Virginia: Haper Collins Publisher.

Richards, J. C. & Renandya, W. A. (2002). *Methodology in Language Teaching: An Anthology of Current Practice*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Rosyidah, L.A. (2009). *Using Picture Series to Enhance the Narrative Writing Ability of the Tenth Graders of SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Jombang*. S-1 unpublished thesis UNESA.

Setiawati, S. (2009). *The Use of Teacher Feedback to Improve Senior High School Students Writing Ability*. Unpublished Thesis. State University of Surabaya

Universitas Negeri Surabaya