

CAPTION AS A TEXT TO PROMOTE STUDENTS' CRITICAL THINKING IN READING COMPREHENSION OF SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL

Astri Sofya Citra

English Department, Languages and Arts Faculty, Universitas Negeri Surabaya

astrisofya17@gmail.com

Abstrak

Akhir-akhir ini, teks caption menjadi teks terbaru dalam kurikulum 2013 yang mengharapkan siswa kelas 12 pada sekolah menengah atas untuk dapat menggunakan pemikiran kritis mereka dalam memahami dan menulis makna tersirat dari teks caption. Oleh karena itu, penelitian fenomenologis ini bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan fenomena naturalistik yang berkaitan dengan implementasi teks caption sebagai teks yang dapat mendukung pemikiran kritis siswa dalam memahami makna tersirat dari sebuah caption, hasil kerja siswa, dan respon mereka. Subjek berjumlah 30 siswa dan seorang guru Bahasa Inggris. Data dikumpulkan dengan melakukan observasi, mengumpulkan karya siswa, dan melakukan wawancara semi-terstruktur. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa ada pelatihan baru yang diberikan oleh guru untuk mendukung pemikiran kritis siswa. Begitu juga, para siswa memberikan penjelasan singkat di luar gambar dengan baik dan mereka merespon bahwa metode dan pelatihan guru berhasil mendukung pemikiran kritis mereka dalam mempelajari teks caption. Dengan demikian, implementasi teks caption dapat mendukung pemikiran kritis siswa dalam memahami makna teks yang tersirat.

Kata Kunci: pemahaman membaca, teks caption, pemikiran kritis.

Abstract

Lately, caption text becomes the newest text in the 2013 curriculum which expects 12th-grade students in senior high school to be able to use their critical thinking in understanding and writing the implied meaning of the caption text. Therefore, this phenomenological research aims to describe naturalistic phenomena related to the implementation of caption text as a text that can promote students' critical thinking in understanding the implied meaning of a caption, students' works, and their responses. The subjects were 30 students and an English teacher. The data were collected by conducting observation, collecting students' works, and conducting the semi-structured interviews. The results showed that there are new treatments given by the teacher to promote students' critical thinking. The students give a brief explanation beyond the picture well and they respond that teachers' methods and training succeeded in promoting their critical thinking in learning caption texts. Thus, the implementation of caption texts can promote students' critical thinking in understanding the implied meaning of the caption.

Keywords: Reading comprehension, caption text, critical thinking.

INTRODUCTION

English has developed more than 1,400 years in various countries internally and for international communication. Nunan (2003) stated that English takes an important role in international communication and as a medium of knowledge. Learning and exploring English must master four skills; listening and reading as receptive skills, while writing and speaking as productive skills. Meanwhile, students need to get good inputs to produce a good English language. Besides students must increase knowledge by listening, students must also read as much as possible. In this case, a problem that often occurs is the difficulty in understanding the contents of a reading. Students difficult to express verbally and in written communication what they have read. Therefore, reading comprehension has

become fundamentally important in the educational success of all individuals (Barier, 2005).

The process of understanding a text is based on a good reader. Duke & Pearson (2009) stated that good readers or active readers can construct, revise, monitor their understanding of the text, and make adjustments in their reading as necessary. Indirectly means that critical thinking must exist in an active reader. In 21st-century, students are able to think more critically while learning (Imaniar & Munir, 2018). Based on the 2013 curriculum, the concept of critical thinking mostly discussed in Indonesia's educational era. Critical thinking is defined as the process of achieving goals that produce a reasonable assessment related to what must be believed and what must be done (Ennis, 2013). According to Scriven and Paul (as cited in Condon & Kelly-Rilley, 2004, p. 64) which states

that critical thinking is the process of having intelligent concepts, applying, analyzing, synthesizing, and evaluating information derived from individual observations, experiences, reflections, reasoning, or communication. Critical thinking will be useful in solving problems.

Nowadays, social media become part of life, especially for the young generation around the world. Indonesians use social media as a medium to express their feelings. They commonly share a picture with a text below using a variety of English writing styles. Text that appears below an image known as captions or a cut line (Grayam, 2010). Caption consists of a set of words that describes or illustrates the image. The question is, as readers do we fully understand what the author conveyed? Here, caption as a means of communicating between the author and the readers so that the message conveyed by the author should be clear. In the past year, captions become one of the basic competencies in the 2013 curriculum which expects 12th-grades high school students to be able to understand the implied meaning of captions, then to write and develop their ideas related to the image.

In this case, captions are a topic that is widely often researched. Maulina R. Cut (2018) mentioned that several elements need to be considered in writing caption such as clarity, conciseness, relevance, context, and attractiveness. In her study, she concluded that students' ability to write captions was quite good, but there were still some elements that needed to be developed. She found that the writing of captions needs to be based on the existence of critical and creative thinking so that images and writing will be connected. This will impact on the readers' involvement when understanding the text. Thus, it can be said that understanding a caption text requires critical thinking. Therefore, based on the previous study and as written in basic competencies that focus students' to be able to understand the implied meaning of caption text attract the researcher to conduct research about how the teacher implement the caption as a text to promote students' critical thinking in comprehending the implied meaning of the caption text. Firstly, it aims to examine the procedure that the teacher uses for teaching captions text. Then, the researcher wants to know how students' work toward the implementation of teaching the captions. The last will describe the students' responses during the teaching and learning process in the classroom.

METHODOLOGY

This research aimed to describe the caption as a text to promote students' critical thinking in comprehending the implied meaning of the caption. To obtain the research objectives, the researcher conducted phenomenological research which described as the application of a qualitative

study to explore and uncover the general meaning of a concept or phenomenon that becomes the life experience of a group. Ary, et al (2010) stated that qualitative study is appropriate to examine behavioral science, for it can explain well the main reason that causes humans to do something. Thus, the researcher wants to understand deeply about the naturalistic phenomenon that relates to the teaching and learning process of caption text that can promote students' critical thinking in understanding the implicit meaning of the text.

This research conducted in MAN 2 Lamongan. The researcher observed this grade in order to know the process of teaching and learning caption text which is considered a complex text that needs a strategy to understand the implicit meaning. The researcher chooses this class because the teacher used the latest Instagram caption as the text that focused on the social issues that can train the students to think more critically. The subjects of this research are the teacher and the students. The 30 students are 12th-graders from a class in this school. Then, the teacher is an English teacher who teaches English in this class.

Since this research is a qualitative study, the researcher was the main research instrument; she collected the data to answer research questions. She used observation sheets, field notes, students' work, and recorded files. She observed the implementation of the caption by using observation sheets as a guideline and taking field notes during the teaching and learning process. Moreover, she collected the students' work to answer the second research question. Furthermore, she conducted a semi-structured interview that has several open-ended questions that can guide the students to answer to optimize the data. She recorded the students' responses to the implementation of the caption.

In this study, the researcher conducted observation to answer the first research question related to how the teacher teaches and how the students' involve during the teaching and learning process. Observation is appropriate for qualitative research which consists of a set of information on how the researcher directly monitors the activities attract the researcher's interest without interfering with the subject (Kothari, 2004). The researcher conducted observation to know all of the activities in how the teacher teaches so that students can develop their critical thinking. During the observation, the researcher used observation sheets to match the method that the teacher used and the researcher expected. Also, the researcher used field notes in monitoring the teaching and learning process. The data gathered from this process describe how the teacher implements the caption as a text to promote students' critical thinking. After the data was collected from the observation, the researcher uses the

lesson plan to know the method used by the teacher in the teaching process. Then, the researcher uses field notes and observation sheets as guidelines to find out how the teacher applies the teaching method used. In this case, it also describes the treatments given by the teacher to promote students to think more critically in understanding the implied meaning of the caption.

Secondly, after knowing the method and treatments used by the teacher, the researcher collected students' works to scrutinize and ensure that their critical thinking was already reflected in their caption text they construct. To answer the second research question which is students' works after the implementation of teaching caption text, the researcher checks all of the students' works in class, consisting of 30 students. She examined their works to know whether the teaching of caption text helps the students to build their critical thinking or not. The researcher used the caption text rubric and critical thinking rubric that already designed before by the researcher to categorize the students' writing. According to the rubric, there are 6 students classified as students that already use their critical thinking to answer all the questions given by the teacher.

Thirdly, to optimize the data on the previous research questions, the researcher conducted a semi-structured interview. Here, the researcher asked the six students who had been categorized in the previous stages as respondents in the interview. In this semi-structured interview, the researcher gave some open-ended questions as a guideline for respondents to answer based on the topic being asked. Meanwhile, the researcher asked several questions related to the teaching and learning process of captions that can build their critical thinking. In this stage, students can answer the questions with statements or stories that provide deeper and new insights. While the researcher investigated and found evidence of how the implementation of teaching caption text can promote the students' critical thinking and how it can be reflected in their works. During the interview, the researcher recorded all the students' answers to make the data comprehensively. In the end, the researcher transferred the recorded files of students' responses into transcription. She wrote the transcriptions to transfer audio data into a set of sentences. During the transcription, the researcher used coding as the way to provides certain codes on the responses of research subjects to determine and specify them into several groups (Kothari, 2004) so that she can analyze the data and relate it to the literature review to show how the students' responses lead to the implementation of teaching the caption text in the classroom.

Additionally, there are three types of data collected in this study. The data comes from observations in the form

of observation sheets, field notes, and the lesson plan analyzes, while the data from students' writing in the form of captions, and interviews in the form of recorded files which already transferred to transcription files. All of these data interpreted qualitatively in the form of words and sentences.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Implementation of Teaching Caption Text as a Text to Promote Students' Critical Thinking in Comprehending the Implied Meaning of Caption

As explained in the background of the study, a caption is a familiar word for people around the world, especially for the young generation. A caption is widely known when operating social media. A caption defined as a brief explanation or description that espouses an illustration or photograph (Alfiyatun, 2018). According to Grayam (2010), the caption must be informative because this would affect the implied meaning in an image. A brief explanation that illustrates the image will be interesting for the readers when viewing the image. Lately, caption text becomes the newest text that exists in the 2013 curriculum for 12th-graders high school students that expected them to be able to analyze the social function, text structures, and linguistic elements from the caption and be able to understand the implied meaning of the caption. They are also expected to be able to express their idea in writing captions. In other words, the students must write an appropriate caption to catch the readers' attention. While readers are expected to understand what the writer conveyed. Whereas, to understand the implied meaning of the caption requires the readers to have the ability to think critically in using reasoning and logic to do conceptual analysis and argue to solve a problem or commonly making decisions (Pithers & Soden, 2000).

All of those explanations related to this study. There were three meetings on the implementation of teaching caption text, it conducted on February 17th, February 24th, and March 2nd. The time was 2x45 minutes. There are 30 students in this class. Based on the observation, there were new treatments by the teacher in teaching caption text. The students were given Instagram captions as the text in their class. The students were more enthusiast and enjoyable in learning the caption text. In teaching caption text, the teacher used project-based learning as a method. Project-based learning is a learning model that challenges students to be able to work individually or cooperatively to complete all the tasks (Larsen-Freeman & Anderson, 2011). The teacher facilitated the students' language learning by engaging them in a variety of tasks that have a clear outcome.

There were some findings related to the implementation of teaching caption texts. According to

Larsen-Freeman & Anderson (2011), teaching using project-based learning divided into several points as follows;

a. Teacher's role

The teacher's role talked about how the teacher taught and how he trained the students to think more critically. Every meeting the teacher always brought his lesson plan to guide how he taught. It is also useful for him to minimize negligence in giving tasks. He strove to motivate students to learn in all meetings. Motivation is one of the topics most frequently researched in the fields of psychology and education. It is generally seen as an impulse or energy that moves people to do things naturally (Han & Yin, 2016). Here, the teacher gave students some latest topics that can motivate them before the class begins. It is also used to be a way to catch the students' interest in learning. In other meetings, he gave them motivation while giving feedback to one of the performers and after the teaching and learning process done at that time.

Furthermore, the teacher trained the students to think more critically. He encouraged them to think more logically and broadly about the topic being discussed. This supports Pithers & Soden's (2000) statement that students need to have a "good thinking" skills in making a decision. Here, the teacher also activated the students' background knowledge. He emphasized the students to always use their background knowledge both reading and writing captions. Every meeting, the teacher required them to always read and look for the news that is being discussed around the world. It will help them to get the latest information and be more up to date so that every discussion students can use their knowledge during the learning process. There was a similarity between teacher's role and theory of critical thinking written by Russel quoted in Halpern's book (2013), when someone starts to think critically in deciding on a matter, he also involves knowledge of facts with prior knowledge, as well as considering the factors that influence him in making a decision (attitude). Indeed, the teacher trained students' to use their background knowledge in comprehending the implied meaning of caption text while evaluating their hypothesis they made before so that they could making decision what the writer want to convey in a caption they read.

b. Students' role

Here, students' role divided into several points. First, the students' involvement in the learning activities. This means that students are involved actively in all class activities. In the first meeting, the

teacher gave some questions as a brainstorming activity to find out the topic to be discussed then students answer verbally. The brainstorming activity used as provocation to recall their memory about the topic discussed in that day. Also, students actively collaborate in completing assignments relevant to the topic both individually and cooperatively. The students doing pair work with the desk mate in identifying the message of the video and continue with discussing session to classify caption texts in the Kemendikbud's book. Otherwise, in the second meeting, some individual student tasks were carried out without involving reading discussion activities; students are given 15 minutes and immediately collect their assignments, the teacher directly continued to the next assignment. Second, students learned to think more relevant and relate to the topic of the material. Students can combine their background knowledge with various facts and references related to the topics they got. This activity was in the second meeting when the teacher gave some pictures to students and students directly wrote a caption that is suitable for the picture. Here, the role of the picture is to train students to understand the implicit meaning of the picture without the accompanying text which then must be given a caption that must match and can explain the contents of the picture. Indeed, the students emphasized using the top-down processing of reading. According to (Saville-Troike, 2018), the students learned to accept and reject the hypothesis they made before and combining their prior knowledge to understand the content of the caption. It was supported by their activity to keep reading and looking for knowledge or information about the topic that given by the teacher so that they could use it as their prior knowledge then they know what the writer wan to convey in the caption text they read. But, students were not able to self-evaluate that enable them to process and interpret the lesson. In this case, the teacher lacked to train students in correcting their mistakes. The teacher always gave the right answer for their mistakes.

c. The material used, the language used, and students' error.

The material used by the teacher supports the learning outcomes. Every meeting, the teacher used caption text from some sources to give the materials so that material attracts the students to keep learning. The teacher gave the updated topics or the latest social issues for them to keep their interest. It could also encourage students to think more. According to (Alfiyatun, 2018), Instagram seems to be a perfect

tool to support learning English for the following reasons. Using Instagram as one of the sources can train the students to criticize the social issues.

Furthermore, the teacher took note and give the best answer to correct the students' errors. He gave feedback after their activity is done. In all the activities during the teaching and learning process, the students' doing peer-feedback with their desk mate. They doing peer-feedback after the teacher gave them feedback to the performers.

Also, according to (Larsen-Freeman & Anderson, 2011) the native language was not emphasized during the teaching and learning process using project-based learning. The teacher only used Indonesian while giving the second explanation for the student who still did not understand what the teacher wants to convey, or when the teacher giving jokes during the teaching and learning process. But all the instructions, the teacher used English. While students used their English when asking questions to the teacher. During discussion, English rarely used by them.

Based on the implementation of teaching caption text using a project-based learning method, it can be concluded that the data obtained about the way the teacher taught was not much different from the researcher's expected. The teacher gave new treatments for students; usually he used newspapers, magazines, or film scenes as the sources of teaching caption, here the teacher used Instagram captions as a text to teach. Instagram captions that contains the latest social issues attract the students' interest. These kinds of topics trained the students to think more critically and broadly about what is happening in the world. The way how the teacher taught was also attracting attention, he trained the students to always read and look for information related to the topic given. Then, during the class session, the teacher gave them some questions that can recall their memory. Indeed, the implementation of the caption text was already appropriate with the teaching of reading in the 2013 curriculum. It means that the teacher already apply the steps in teaching reading using project-based learning method. Also, the updated social issues as the topic of caption and the teacher's treatments which allows the students to keep on reading the latest issues can promote students' to think more critically.

Students' Works after the Implementation of Teaching Caption Text as a Text to Promote Students' Critical Thinking in Comprehending the Implied Meaning of Caption

The students asked to make a caption dealing with the updated social issues for the topic. Then, students asked to switch the caption with their friends randomly and answer

the questions dealing with their comprehension of the caption. The task contained five questions, those were to find the detailed information of the caption, find the implicit meaning, and rewrite the new version of the caption by the students. The researcher analyzes the students' tasks based on the rubric that adopted from (J.B Heaton, 1988) and (Paul & Elder, 2006). Here, the researcher took 6 students' works and classified them into several categories as follows;

- The first category was excellent to very good, three students were included in this category. Student E got the highest score for this task. He talked about the coronavirus; the newest disease that was attacking almost all regions in the world. Student A got the second-best score after student E. Student A talked about the death of Kobe Bryant. While student D came in third after them. Student D talked about growing food using old mattresses. Here, the topic they got was the latest topic being discussed over the world. Three of them answered all the questions correctly. They could elaborate the topic clearly. Their writing was knowledgeable for all the readers. They provided detailed information about the topic completely. The students got detailed information of the caption was not only by reading the text below but also by comprehending and looking into the picture. It supported by (Rohmania, 2014), pictures can be used as an illustration for the students to interpret the implicit meaning of words or objects. Accurately they know what the previous writer wants to convey and good in explaining it. Then, they supported their idea with a lot of logical facts and evidence about the topic. The number of words used by those students was included in the "sophisticated category" which is in 16 and so on. They wrote some idiom choices and effective words in rewriting the caption. The suitability of the text with the image was already relevant. They did not use their own perspective without knowing the picture well. They were used the consider statements from the various points of view. They connected their thoughts made with the picture they got. They could express their ideas in the form of a description or sentence to know the meaning of the utterance in a situation that has to do with the event. It means that they could attract their readers to read their captions by their good writing.
- Two students were in the good to average category. They were student B who talked about Australia's bushfire crisis which caused rare

animals like koalas need to be helped immediately while student F talked about the death of Big Tim. Both of them answered the questions correctly. They also explained clearly about the topic. They could comprehend the issues very well. They used their prior knowledge to know the implicit meaning of the caption written by the previous writer. But there, they only described it based on the picture. Furthermore, they could deliver what can be inferred from the caption. Like the previous students, they gave some facts about the topic while rewrote it. It supported by (Grayam, 2010) that a caption must be informative because this would affect the meaning implicit in an image. The difference between good to average categories and very good to very good categories is that students who are in the good to average category still use their bias in answering the questions given. Student F answered, "The death of Tim saddened all Kenyans". It means that they were still writing occasional errors of the word.

- The last category was fair to poor category. Here there was only one student. Student C got a very unique topic that talked about the new conservation animal program. She answered the questions well but she did not provide clear ideas such as who made the program and where the program was made. She could not provide a lot of facts about the program. She uses her perspective without knowing the picture further. She could not provide information that illustrates the action on the picture well.

Based on the students' tasks, it can be concluded that most of the students get high points with good comprehending. The questions given by the teacher can be used to train the students to think more critically. The questions guided the students to think beyond the caption they got. From their answer, it could be seen that they know the implicit meaning of the caption although the caption was very simple. Also, the way how they rewrote the caption was very good. They rewrote the caption with an effective word choice and usage. They wrote about 11 to 16 words. They gave more information that did not exist in the picture but still related. They combine their prior knowledge, the information they got, and their own opinion in a good language structure. They put their reasonable argument in writing the caption. The statement supported by (Indah, 2017), states that there is a relationship between critical thinking and writing so that the readers understand the implicit meaning of the caption itself. Here it can be concluded that their activities can promote their critical thinking. In this case their critical

thinking can be seen in their work. It was supported by Russell quoted in (Halpern's, 2013) book, "Critical thinking involves knowledge of facts with prior knowledge, as well as considering the factors that influence him in making a decision (attitude)".

Students' Responses towards the Implementation of Teaching Caption Text as a Text to Promote Students' Critical Thinking in Comprehending the Implied Meaning of Caption

The six participants in this stage were the students who had written their assignments above. There were five questions for the students; the first about students' knowledge about the caption, second about their views on a good caption, third about the material provided by the teacher in the class, fourth about the difficulties they experienced during the learning process and how to overcome them, and fifth about their opinions after learning caption. Based on the interview results, students' answers about the method used by the teacher in three recent meetings were already appropriate with the teaching and learning process in the classroom. From those open-ended questions, most of them explained how they comprehend the caption and write the caption.

Responding to the interview questions above, the three recent meetings attract the students' interest so that they could enjoy the class. Writing good captions has several rules. Their answers correspond with the researcher rubric which states that a good caption should be considering several rules; clarity, conciseness, relevance, context, and attractiveness. This proves that the teacher has taught how to write captions correctly. Also, they said that the material used by the teacher can attract their interest to keep on going to the learning process. The updated caption as a text not only can attract the students' interest but also trained the students to think more critically about the latest social issues around the world. Interestingly, the researcher found there were new treatments uses by the teacher related to the students' answers. The teacher trained the students' critical thinking by giving the latest social issues as a topic to teach caption text and reminding them to keep on reading all the social issues that just happened over the world. Students decide that the new teacher treatments can promote their critical thinking both in comprehending the implicit meaning of caption and writing a good caption. Their answer related to the next question about the problem they had during the teaching and learning process. For the first time, they were difficult to know the message of the caption. They cannot conclude what the writer wants to convey. To overcome it, students were helped by the teacher treatments to always keep on going to read the latest social issues on many sources. They said it trained them to accept and reject their hypothesis made before.

Students' reflection after class also showed that how the teacher teaches can promote their critical thinking when comprehending the caption text.

Indeed, based on the students' responses can be concluded that all of them were helped by the teacher's teaching method and treatments so that they could think more critically while comprehending the caption text. It supported by (Grayam, 2010) a brief explanation or description of an image will be interesting to the readers when viewing an issue. From their answer, it can be concluded that the way how the teacher treated them was run well.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Conclusion

To conclude, this study supports the implementation of the caption as a text to promote students' critical thinking in comprehending the caption effectively. Some findings found by the researcher. First, the teacher gave a new treatment for the students. Commonly the teacher use magazine, newspaper, or film scenes as the sources of the caption, here he used Instagram caption as the text of teaching and learning process. The teacher gave some social issues as a topic that could attract students' interest and trained their critical thinking. Second, the way how the teacher taught here was also attracting attention. Not only to the aim of increasing students' critical thinking, but also he required students' to always read and look for information related to the latest social issues. Then, it was supported by giving questions directly that recall their memories about the topic if the students could not follow the topic discussed. Third, he gave a caption without text below the picture. This was very useful for students to train their critical thinking to know the implicit meaning of an image. However, the implementation of the caption text was already appropriate to the teaching of reading in the 2013 curriculum and can promote students to think critically. It was proven by the critical thinking rubric in reading comprehension, that the implementation has enough fulfilled the aspects. Thus, caption as a text has promoted the students in comprehending the content of the text in deep.

While the way how the teacher trained the students affected the students' reading process in comprehending a caption. It can be seen on their tasks that most of the students get high points with good comprehending. They could combine their prior knowledge with the new information they got. They could accept and reject their hypothesis made before then they tried to rewrite the caption by themselves.

Furthermore, based on the students' responses towards the teaching caption, it can be concluded that almost all students said Instagram caption helped them to read the

implicit meaning of the caption itself. Indirectly, they mentioned steps to think more critically while reading the caption. So, it can be concluded that caption as a text supported their critical thinking in comprehending a text.

Suggestion

In the teaching and learning process, it is necessary for the teacher to give some cooperative learning to the students. It will train them to work in a team. Let them work together with their friends not only with their desk mate so that they can share a lot of information about the topic. Besides, they can learn more about how to make a good decision for some problems.

For the other teachers, it is better to use Instagram as a medium to teach caption, it will more motivate the students to learn. Using Instagram caption to teach caption as a text has been proved by the researcher that it could make the students feel interested, motivated, and easily understand in comprehending the implicit meaning of the caption. Then, it will better if teachers used another method to teach so that the students' critical thinking will be developed.

For the other future researchers, the researcher hopes that in the future there will be the other researchers who will conduct or develop this research or other research which is still related to this research. They may conduct different skills in English, such as listening, writing, or speaking. It can be also conducted for other English components like grammar, pronunciation, syntax, etc.

REFERENCES

- Aji, S. D., Hudha, M. N., Huda, C., & Ali, E. (2018). The improvement of learning effectiveness in the lesson study by using e-rubric. *Journal of Engineering Science and Technology*, 13(5), 1181–1189.
- Alfiyatun, A., & Muntaha, M. (2018). *The Effectiveness of Instagram Captions to Teach Writing (An Experimental Research on the Tenth Grade Students of SMA Muhammadiyah 1 Karanganyar in Academic Year 2017/2018)* (Doctoral dissertation, IAIN SURAKARTA).
- Ary, D., Jacobs, L. C., Sorensen, C., & Razavieh, A. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education* (8th Editio, Vol. 1; T. William, ed.). USA: Wadsworth Cenage Learning.
- Baier, R. J. (2005). Reading Comprehension and Reading Strategies. *The Journal of Education*, 5th Edition. *Reading*, 1–53. Retrieved from <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/b85a/6ccfeba15122c5269c6543b22e921a7338c8.pdf>
- Duke, N. K., & Pearson, P. D. (2009). Effective Practices for Developing Reading Comprehension. *Journal of Education*, 189(1–2), 107–122.

- <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022057409189001-208>
- Ennis, R. H. (2013). *A Definition of Critical Thinking*. 17(8), 599–612. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20197828>.
- Grayam, L. (2010). Writing Photo Captions, Redbubble Artistic Journal, (Online), <https://www.redbubble.com/people/grayam/journal/4742583writing-photo-captions>, accessed November 2019).
- Halpern, D. F. (2013). Thought and Knowledge (An Introduction to Critical Thinking). In *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* (Fifth Edit, Vol. 53). <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Han, J., & Yin, H. (2016). Teacher motivation: Definition, research development and implications for teachers. *Cogent Education*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1217819>
- Hwang, G. J., Hsu, T. C., & Hsieh, Y. H. (2019). Impacts of Different Smartphone Caption/Subtitle Mechanisms on English Listening Performance and Perceptions of Students with Different Learning Styles. *International Journal of Human-Computer Interaction*, 35(4–5), 333–344. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10447318.2018.1543091>
- Imaniar, F., & Munir, A. (2018). *Critical Thinking in Writing: What Do Teachers Actually Teach?* 341–347.
- Indah, R. N. (2017). Critical Thinking, Writing Performance and Topic Familiarity of Indonesian EFL Learners. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 8(2), 229. <https://doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0802.04>
- Kothari, C. R. (2004). Research Methodology (Method and Techniques). In *College of Commerce University of Rajasthan, Jaipur (India)* (Second Rev). NEW AGE INTERNATIONAL.
- Larsen-Freeman, D., & Anderson, M. (2011). *Techniques & Principles in Language Teaching* (3rd ed.). Oxford University Press.
- Maulina R. Cut, Muslem Asnawi, Y. (2018). An Analysis of Students' Ability in Writing Caption Through Instagram. *Research in English Education*, 2(February), 227–249.
- McNamara, D. S. (2017). *Reading Comprehension Strategies (Theories, Interventions, and Technologies)* (D. S. McNamara, ed.). <https://doi.org/10.23918/vesal2017.a37>
- Merriam, B. Sharan., Tisdell, J. E. (2016). *Qualitative Research a Guide and Design Implementation* (fourth edi). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Nunan, D., Higgins, C., & Edge, J. (2003). The Impact of English as a Global Language on Educational Policies and Practices in the Asia-Pacific Region. *Tesol Quarterly*, 37(4), 589–613.
- Oakhill, J., Cain, K., & Elbro, C. (2015). Understanding and teaching reading comprehension. A handbook. In *Educational Psychology in Practice* (Vol. 31). <https://doi.org/10.1080/02667363.2015.1052233>
- Paul, R. D., & Elder, L. D. (2006). Critical Thinking (Concept and Tools). *Performance + Instruction*, 34(6), 14–17. <https://doi.org/10.1002/pfi.4170340606>
- Pithers, R. T., & Soden, R. (2000). Critical thinking in education: A review. *Educational Research*, 42(3), 237–249. <https://doi.org/10.1080/001318800440579>
- Rudd, R., Baker, M., & Hoover, T. (2000). Undergraduate Agriculture Student Learning Styles and Critical Thinking Abilities: Is There a Relationship? *Journal of Agricultural Education*, 41(3), 2–12. <https://doi.org/10.5032/jae.2000.03002>
- Saville-Troike, M. (2018). Introducing Second Language Acquisition. In *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* (Vol. 53). <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781107415324.004>
- Urquhart, S., & Weir, C. (2013). Reading in a Second Language: Process, Product, And Practice (N. C. Candlin, ed.). London and New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Vagle, M. D. (2016). Crafting Phenomenological Research. In *Crafting Phenomenological Research* (Second Edi). <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315431451>