

## **RECIPROCAL TEACHING AS A TECHNIQUE TO PROMOTE STUDENTS' CRITICAL THINKING IN COMPREHENDING A TEXT FOR SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL STUDENTS**

**Fenti Arifiyanti**

English Department, Language and Arts Faculty, Universitas Negeri Surabaya

[Fentiarifiyanti16020084002@mhs.unesa.ac.id](mailto:Fentiarifiyanti16020084002@mhs.unesa.ac.id)

### **Abstrak**

Minat siswa untuk belajar dan membaca teks berbahasa Inggris secara terperinci di jenjang sekolah menengah atas sangatlah sedikit. Hal ini dikarenakan banyak dari mereka berpikiran bahwa Bahasa Inggris merupakan bahasa asing di Indonesia sehingga mereka tidak perlu untuk terlalu memahaminya secara mendalam. Disisi lain, berdasarkan kurikulum 2013 siswa diharapkan mampu menjadi pembelajar mandiri serta kritis di dalam maupun luar kelas. Sehingga peran guru dalam pemilihan teknik mengajar disini sangatlah penting untuk membuat siswa tertarik untuk memahami teks Bahasa Inggris. Proses belajar mengajar dapat lebih efektif jika dilakukan dalam kelompok belajar sehingga siswa dapat menyampaikan pendapat dan pemikirannya masing-masing. Diskusi disini dilakukan melalui beberapa tahapan yaitu memprediksi, bertanya, mengklarifikasi, dan menyimpulkan yang disebut pengajaran timbal balik. Pengajaran menggunakan teknik ini mendorong siswa untuk berpikir kritis dan mempengaruhi pemahaman mereka terhadap teks naratif. Subjek penelitian adalah siswa kelas 10 SMA di Gresik. Peneliti melakukan observasi, merekam penerapan teknik, dan mengamati hasil lembar kerja siswa. Hal ini bertujuan untuk mendeskripsikan penggunaan teknik dan cara berpikir kritis siswa. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa guru menggunakan teknik ini sesuai dengan beberapa teori penelitian dan mampu menunjukkan bahwa pembelajaran timbal balik mendorong siswa untuk berpikir kritis dan memahami teks yang memiliki pertanyaan keterampilan berpikir tingkat tinggi.

**Kata kunci:** Teknik pembelajaran, Teknik pengajaran timbal balik, Berpikir kritis, Teks naratif.

### **Abstract**

The students' interest in learning and reading English text are very low. It is because many of them think that English as a foreign language in Indonesia so they don't need to comprehend it deeply. On the other hand, based on 2013 curriculum students are expected to become independent and critical learners in the learning process. Thus, the role of the teacher in selecting the teaching technique is important in order to make the students are able to comprehend an English text. Moreover, teaching and learning in group discussion can be more effective because the students can respectively explore their idea. The group discussion which is called as reciprocal teaching is carried out through several stages such as predicting, questioning, clarifying, and concluding. This technique encourages the students to think critically and comprehend the narrative text deeply. The subjects of the study were tenth grader high school students in Gresik. The Researcher conducted the observations, records the implementation of technique, and observe the student worksheets. It aims to describe the use of technique and the way of students critically thinking. The results showed that the teacher employed the suitable stages based on several research theories and this technique was able to encourage the students to think critically by answering some of high order thinking skills questions.

**Keywords:** Teaching technique, Reciprocal teaching, Critical thinking, Narrative text

### **1. INTRODUCTION**

English in Indonesia is taught as a foreign language in order to develop students' communication and language skill. It is because English take a big role in this era as international language communication and medium knowledge (Nunan, 2003). There are four skills when learning English such as reading, listening, speaking, and writing. One of the most important skills that must be

learnt by the students is reading skill because it is part of receptive skill as the first source to get the knowledge. Based on Yunus, & Parlindungan study (2012), reading is an important skill in language because it expands someone knowledge about the language itself. This is also supported by Celce-Murcia (2001:154) that by reading written text, the readers can develop the meaning or understanding based on their experience, background

knowledge, and purpose of reading. Furthermore, Grabe and Stoller study in (2002) stated that reading is important because it engages in every practice in learning process. Here, reading means comprehension to understand and interpret the messages that deliver in the text not only knowing the words by words. According to Nuttal (2002), reading is the way of interaction between the writer's idea to the reader's. So the reader's are able to get the idea from the writer by understanding the intended meaning of the text as a process of transferring information. Foutas and Pinnel (2012) stated that comprehension is a key in critical and complex thinking ability because without good comprehension the students' cannot get the explicit and implicit meaning of the text which is necessary to help them get the information.

In reading a text, the teacher needs to promote students' critical thinking through reading comprehension because students not only are able to get the meaning on the line but also between and beyond the line. It means that the students must have good comprehension to get the information that is written explicitly or implicitly in the text. The concept of critical thinking already developed in Indonesia 2013 curriculum which expects the students become independent, critical, collaborative, communicative, creative, and productive learner especially for senior high school students. Adopting from Bloom taxonomy of educational objectives, there are five skills that are required as critical thinking of students' such as, (1) reasoning, (2) comprehension, application, analysis, and synthesis, (3) interpretation, (4) argumentation, and (5) evaluation.

According to Scriven and Paul study in 2004, critical thinking itself means that the way of think by having precise conceptualizing, analyzing, synthesizing, and evaluating that appear from individual experience, background knowledge, and reasoning. According to Halpern study in (2014) defined that critical thinking is the unity of cognitive skills and strategies in order to raise a desirable achievement. It means that critical thinking is the cognitive skill that must be learned for every student who learns language especially English in order to enhance their ability in learning something new.

However, most of students in Indonesia have difficulty to build critical thinking when reading a text. It is because some factors such as students reading interest. It is supported by Selasar Budaya (2015), In 2012 UNESCO conducted a research that showed only one person from one thousand sampling who had interest in reading a book. Many students think that reading is kind of boring activity because the text length and the unfamiliar words that may appear in reading process so it makes the students hard to concentrate in reading

passages. Second, The students' are lack of motivation because they live in Indonesia so they think English is unimportant to be learned. Based on Slavin study in 2008, motivation is what makes you keep going. It means that motivation influences individual interest and activity including in reading English text. In fact, many students are hard to read and comprehend English passage because their mother tongue is Bahasa. Third, the inappropriate technique used by the teacher which make the students' do not enjoy the learning process. It causes them cannot achieve the goal of learning process as critical and independent learner in reading class.

To overcome those problems, the teacher needs to implement a teaching technique that motivate the students to read easily. As stated by McCrea (2003), the purpose of teaching reading is to get the information of the text efficiently. It means that the students' are expected to comprehend the reading passage and know the message which is delivered in the text. There are many kind of teaching reading techniques nowadays. One of them is using reciprocal teaching. According to Pallinscar, & Brown (1984), Reciprocal teaching is a teaching technique that urges the students to comprehend the reading passages. There are four stages in this technique such as predicting which assumes the students to predict the main ideas related to the text by stating a hypothesis. The students' must have background knowledge about the topic so they could make it as their self-monitoring in comprehending the text. Second, questioning which improve student comprehension within the subject area (Gruenbaum, 2014). This stage is good to answer students' curiosity because they must ask some questions based on the text. It helps the students' to explore more detail information that is conveyed in the text. Third, clarifying which make the students to identify some problems or difficulties that may appear in the learning process (Gruenbaum, 2014). This stage urges the students to find the problem solving and give clear critical solution of the unclear information. The last, summarising which command the students to re-write the most important idea of the text. This stage also shows the students comprehension level of the text. According to Gruenbaum (2014), this stage could challenge the students' because they must determine the important information to keep in summary.

There are three instructional principles in Reciprocal technique such as, teaching comprehension, modeling, and students discussing and practicing in a group that is under guided by a teacher (Okkinga, 2018). This techniques assumes that the students' will work in group discussion and practice the stages independently. Before that, the teacher give the instruction only at beginning as a modelling. This technique also shows the cooperative

learning method which makes the students become more active than the teacher in the learning process. Killen (2006) also supported that this technique makes the students independent to find information related to the material. The teacher role here only becomes the guide not the main source of material in the learning process. It means that reciprocal teaching influences the students to become independent and active learner when finding the information in the learning process. Furthermore, the previous research investigated by (Okkinga, 2018) showed that reciprocal teaching belongs to adolescent low achievers' reading comprehension. Reciprocal teaching give the students chance to communicate in group discussion in order to state their own opinion so every student will have the each role such as predictor, questioner, stating clarifying, and making summary.

Further, Pilten (2016) conducted reciprocal teaching as an effective teaching strategy in a Konya province primary school on comprehension of expository text. The result of this technique has a significant effect on students comprehending expository skills through some kind of test. Nizmah, et al., (2015) compared between the use of reciprocal teaching and lecturing method in teaching listening to tenth-grade students of MAN Palangkaraya. It is found that there is a difference in the effectiveness of teaching listening viewed from self-esteem based on the result of the students' scores who taught by reciprocal teaching are higher than those students who using lecturing. Amrullah, et al., (2014) also investigated the effect of reciprocal teaching at SMP Negeri 6 Jember and the result shows that reciprocal teaching technique has a great contribution to the eighth- grade students' reading comprehension achievement in reading recount texts. On the other hand, a few studies applying this technique to promote students critical thinking.

However, In 2013 Curriculum, there are some texts that are taught by the teacher in senior high school. One of them is narrative text, the students are expected to build their critical thinking independently by comprehending the writer idea then they can reconstruct it based on their point of view. Reciprocal teaching could be an appropriate teaching technique in reading a narrative text because it helps the students to comprehend the text easily by discussing together and building their critical thinking to find out the message that implied in the text.

It can be concluded that this research investigate the use of Reciprocal Teaching to promote the students' critical thinking because the previous studies used other design of research, class level, and the purpose of using reciprocal teaching (reading comprehension achievement only) whereas, this technique could be used for reading narrative text to promote the students' critical thinking. Thus, the formed research problem would be: How does

the Reciprocal Teaching promote the students' critical thinking in reading narrative text?

Based on the research problem, the researcher made two reasons to conduct this study. First, how is the implementation of Reciprocal Teaching as a technique to promote students' critical thinking in comprehending a narrative text? The purpose of it is to check whether the teacher used all of the stages of Reciprocal teaching or not. Second how are the students' reading comprehensions toward the implementation of Reciprocal Teaching as a technique to promote students' critical thinking in reading a text?

## **METHOD**

This study purpose is to describe the use of Reciprocal Teaching technique to promote the students' critical thinking in comprehending a narrative text for senior high school. The researcher would use qualitative research in conducting this study in order to present deeper explanation of data. According to Ary, et al (2010) qualitative research is kind of research that explains the data in the form of words rather than form of number. In this study, the researcher chose to use phenomenology research study because this study based on experience or phenomenon that has happened in particular group (Creswell, 2013).

This study conducted in the one of senior high school in Gresik. The researcher chose this school because there was a teacher who had already implemented the Reciprocal teaching technique in reading narrative text so conducting this study in this school would match the researcher's objective which was describing the use of reciprocal teaching in promoting the students' critical thinking in comprehending a narrative text. The subjects of this study were tenth graders in science class that consist of twenty five students.

The researcher became the primary instrument in this study because the researcher was the one who collected the data for the research questions. Therefore, the researcher needed another instrument to fulfill the data. In this study, the researcher conducted the observation which included the observation sheet, field note, recorder file, and the students' work sheet. Furthermore, the researcher used the observation sheet in order to check the situation of the class when using Reciprocal teaching. Field note as the real documentation of activities that happened in the class. Then, recorder file purpose was to observe the stages when the teacher implement this technique. Next, the recorder file was as supporting data to observe the students works in group discussion. Moreover, the researcher also used the students' worksheets in order to check whether the role of Reciprocal teaching could promote their critical thinking.

The researcher conducted the observation and used field note, observation sheet and recorder file to answer the first research question. The researcher did an observation by joining the learning process in the class. After that, the researcher observed the using of Reciprocal teaching by the teacher while taking note and looking for the checklist on the observation sheet. From all of these instruments, the researcher would be able to describe the implementation of reciprocal teaching in promoting the students' critical thinking in comprehending a narrative text. The researcher also checked the students' worksheet in order to answer the second research questions. The student worksheet contained some HOTS questions to check the students' comprehension and critical thinking after the implementation of Reciprocal teaching. There were only four groups which means only 17 students' worksheet in that day because some of students must join the competition. Most of the students could answer the questions correctly. So it can be concluded that the data that researcher got were observation sheet, field note, the recorded file from the teaching and learning process and from the students' worksheet.

The researcher analyzed the observation sheet data and the recorded file in order to answer the first research question. The researcher checked how the teacher implemented the stages of Reciprocal teaching and the situation of the class. It means that the researcher checked whether the stages of reciprocal teaching was the same as the theory that has been written in the literature review and how the students' behavior in the learning process. Next, the researcher also transcribed the audio recorder in order to get more detail information about the use of reciprocal teaching in the class.

After that, the researcher collected the students' work sheet and analyzed the students work based on the reading comprehension and critical thinking rubric. After checking the students' works, the researcher concluded the result of study whether Reciprocal teaching could promote students' critical thinking in comprehending the narrative text or not.

## RESULT AND DISCUSSION

### **The Use of Reciprocal Teaching as a Technique to Promote Students' Critical Thinking in Comprehending Narrative Text for Senior High School Students'**

Reciprocal teaching is a technique that require the students' interaction in every activity (Rosenberg, 2011:14). Its purpose is to help the students' promoting their critical thinking in a group discussion. In the learning process showed that this technique could help

the students' to comprehend the narrative text quickly. The students' also become more critical in discussion section which it is as the objective of 2013 curriculum.

In pre-teaching, the teacher didn't explain the material directly but the teacher tried to trigger the students' prior knowledge about narrative text. In whilst teaching, the teacher explained more about narrative text such as the definition, the generic structure, and the purpose. Then the teacher continued to explain Reciprocal teaching strategy such as how to predict, ask question, clarify the problem, and summarize the story.

Based on Majeed study in 2013, there are three main points in the implementation of reciprocal teaching such as preparation, presentation, and feedback. Amrullah et al. (2014) study also showed that reciprocal teaching can be done through cooperative learning so they involve in group discussion in order to maximize their learning. It helps the students to elaborate their idea in the discussion by exchanging or sharing opinions with their friends also giving feedback to their friends if they have different ideas. Moreover, there are nine steps to apply this technique in the class (Hellystia, 2017).

1. The teacher distributes the material in form of the reading text to the students'
2. The teacher and the students' read the title or look at the picture only in order to predict the topic of material that they will discuss.
3. The students' are divided into some groups that consist of four students and the group should select the leader.
4. The students' start to read the paragraph
5. The students' determine the main idea of the text and predict the next paragraph.
6. The other students' make some questions related the text.
7. The other member clarify if any difficulties or problems.
8. The leader of group make a summary based on the result of discussion.
9. The leader of the group will seek feedback from the group members on every four strategies.

The teacher had done apply all the steps which is same as the theory. The teacher also gave some comprehension check questions in order to check the students' understanding of the text. The students' stated their opinion when answering some questions which it was good for their reasoning so they could get the message of the narrative text. The students' comprehension can be classified as a good comprehension because from the beginning, the students' can follow the teacher explanation and instruction quickly

Based on Davis and Voirin (2016) theory stated that by using reciprocal teaching students and teacher communicate at the beginning of the learning process only then, students can do or instruct by themselves in a group discussion. It was proofed that in this research, the teacher gave some stimulation to answer the first worksheet so it reflected the interaction between teacher as modeling and students' then the students did the second worksheet independently in group discussion.

### **The Students' Worksheet**

According to the students' worksheet, the researcher got high score from the 17 students. The assessment of students' work used critical thinking and reading strategy rubric adopted from Casco Bay High School. It means most of the students could comprehend the task that is required a high order thinking skill.

The first activity was about predicting the story. The students' predict the theme by reading the title. Then they answered based on their prior knowledge. Most of them could answer it very well because it was the narrative story from Indonesia so they certainly ever heard about it. It can be seen from how they developed sophisticated prediction by reading the title because it was the one of criteria for inferring and synthesizing in critical thinking and reading strategy rubric although there was grammatical error for some students. According to (Ockuz study in 2010), predicting is the first step to help the students reading comprehension by setting the purpose of reading in the beginning.

The second activity was about the students' opinion toward the main idea of the paragraph and making questions based or beyond the paragraph. Most of the students' determined the main idea correctly. It can be seen from the students' could re-arrange and paraphrase the words. It stated in rubric for making connection criteria so it means that they could explain and determine what the important information is by understanding the text.

The next is questioning, it helps the students to improve their comprehension of the text because it require them to generate questions about main idea of the paragraph and important detail. From the students' answer, it can be seen that they raise questions well so they can fulfill the rubric criteria to raise sophisticated questions that lead to further thinking and questioning

The third activity asked the students about the meaning of words. Some students answered that they had understood the meaning of words by guessing and some students by re-reading the text. It is as the way for students' to overcome the problem in reading a text and it also helps the students' become more strategic reader. Based on rubric for monitoring comprehension criteria

most of students could fix the problem in worksheet and group discussion in good score.

The fourth activity asked the students to make summary by retelling the story that they had read. Based on the students' result of summary, it could be seen that the students were able to comprehend the whole of story because the students used their language when making summary which contained about the general information until the specific information based on the text.

The last activity was about comprehension check questions. There were five questions that asked students' opinion about the text.

Based on the students' answer of all questions, the reciprocal teaching has been proven in promoting the students' critical thinking because most of them were able to answer the HOTS questions and active in the learning process. It is also supported by Bloom taxonomy of educational objectives that there are five skills that are required as critical thinking of students' such as, (1) reasoning, (2) comprehension, application, analysis, or synthesis, (3) interpretation, (4) argumentation, and (5) evaluation. The students had done the five skills that are required as critical thinker student for example, they stated their critical reason and opinion in some comprehension check question. Second, to check their comprehension, it could be seen from their summary whether it is related to the story in the text and retell by using their own language or not. The next, interpretation activity in predicting the story by reading some short paragraph so it could provoke them to interpret the story that will happen. Then, delivering argumentation activity could be seen in finding the main idea and questioning section. The last, evaluation in clarifying section so the students could evaluate their problem and difficulty when comprehending the text and it indirectly leads them to think for the problem solving.

## **CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION**

### **Conclusion**

Based on the result and discussion, the researcher concluded that the use of reciprocal teaching technique to promote students' critical thinking in comprehending a narrative text was applied well in learning process. The students were able to implement the stages of reciprocal teaching in their reading activity such as predicting, questioning, clarifying, and summarizing. It was because the teacher could explain the stages briefly but in detail. Those stages indirectly promoted students' critical thinking because most of questions in worksheet contained HOTS questions and activities. Fortunately, most of the students were able to answer all HOTS questions correctly. The students also actively involved

in group discussion and fell at ease while doing the task which it also made them more relaxed when giving their opinion and asking questions. In addition, the critical thinking rubric in reading comprehension showed that the use of reciprocal teaching in comprehending narrative text has enough fulfilled all of the criteria. Thus, the implementation of reciprocal teaching has helped the students' to comprehend the text easily.

### Suggestion

There were some suggestions for the teacher in order to improve the use of Reciprocal teaching. First, the teacher needs to use some media such as video or power point slide when explaining the material to help the students' clearly understands the material. Second, the teacher may not allow the students' to use the gadget in order to make them more concentrate in learning process. Third, when conducting reciprocal teaching technique the teacher already explained the stages briefly and the students could understand but it will be better if the teacher give example first of each stages in reciprocalteaching.

There is a suggestion for the students. The students needed to read a lot in order to help them to enrich their vocabulary. Second, the students' should remember the stages of reciprocal teaching in the future so they could comprehend the text easily.

There are some suggestions for future researcher. The researcher should conduct this research in quantitative research in order to know whether the use of reciprocal teaching has a significant different or not before and after treatment. Moreover, the researcher could find more challenging text to trigger the students' critical thinking when comprehending the text.

### REFERENCES

- Alsaraireh, M. Y. (2018). The Effect of the Reciprocal Teaching Model on Developing Jordanian Students' Reading Comprehension at Mutah University. *International Journal of Linguistics*, 8, 104. <http://doi.org/10.5296/ijl.v8i6.10448>
- Alyousef, H. S. (2005). Teaching reading comprehension to ESL/EFL learners. *The reading Matrix* 5(2), September 2005. Accessed on November 25th, 2019. <http://acrobet.rider.co.id>
- Ary, D. e. (2010). *Introduction to Research in Education*. Wadsworth: Cengage Learning.
- A'yun, Q., & Yunus, M. (2017). The efficacy of reciprocal teaching method in teaching reading comprehension to EFL students. *ELT-Echo*, 2, 134–146. <http://doi.org/10.24235/eltecho..>
- Dararat, P. (2012). *Technique on reading comprehension of Matayom Suksa 1 Students. The effect of jigsaw II*. Bangkok. Srinakharinwirot University.
- Davis, N. L., & Voirin, J. (2016). Reciprocal writing as a creative Technique. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, 11(1), 66-77. <http://doi.org/10.1080/15401383.2015.1033043>.
- Embryany, F., & Adnan, A. (2017). Improving senior high school students' ability in comprehending descriptive text by using reciprocal technique. *Journal of English Language Teaching*, 6(1), 263-271
- Gruenbaum, E. A. (2012). Reading and Common Literacy Struggles with College Students : Using the Reciprocal Teaching Technique. *Journal of College Reading and Learning*, 42, 109–116. <http://doi.org/10.1080/10790195.2012.10850357>
- Hellystia, D. (2017). The effectiveness of reciprocal teaching in fostering reading comprehensive of struggling. *Journal Of Language And Literature*, 5(2), 84-90.
- Huang, C., & Yang, S. C. (2015). Effects of online reciprocal teaching on reading strategies, comprehension, self-efficacy, and motivation. *Journal of Educational Computing*, 52(3), 381–407. <http://doi.org/10.1177/0735633115571924>.
- Nunan, D. (2003). *Practical english language teaching*. New York. The McGraw- Hill Companies.
- Nuttal, C. (2000). *Teaching reading skills in a foreign language*. Oxford. Macmillan education.
- Okkinga, M. (2018). Effects of reciprocal teaching on reading comprehension of low-achieving adolescents, The importance of specific teaching skills. *Journal of Research in Reading*, 41(1), 20–41. <http://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9817.12082>
- Pai, H., Sears, D. A., & Maeda, Y. (2015). Effects of small-group learning on transfer: a meta-Analysis. *Education Psychology Review*, 27, 79–102 DOI 10.1007/s10648-014-9260-8
- Palinscar, A. S., Brown, A. L., Palinscar, A. S., & Brown, A. L. (1984). Reciprocal Teaching of Comprehension- Fostering and Comprehension-Monitoring Activities Reciprocal Teaching of Comprehension- Fostering and Comprehension-Monitoring Activities, *Cognition, and Instruction*, 1(2), 117-175, DOI:10.1207/s1532690xcio102.
- Peng, T. L., & Wang, S. H. (2015). Effects of reciprocal teaching on EFL fifth graders' English reading ability. *International Journal of Contemporary Educational Research*, 2, 76-88.
- Pilten, G. (2016). The Evaluation of Effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Strategies on Comprehension of Expository Texts. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, Vol. 4 (10). DOI: 10.11114/jets.v4i10.1791.

- Rambah, S., & Hulu, R. (2014). Improving students' speaking ability by using reciprocal. *Jurnal Ilmiah Edu Research* ,3(1), 17–20.
- Schünemann, N., Spörer, N., & Brunstein, J. C. (2013). Integrating self-regulation in whole-class reciprocal teaching: A moderator–mediator analysis of incremental effects on fifth graders' reading comprehension. *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 38,289–305.
- Wanzek, J., Vaughn, S., Kent, S. C., Swanson, A., Roberts, G., Haynes, M., & Fall, A. (2014). The Effects of Team-Based Learning on Social Studies Knowledge Acquisition in High School. *Journal of Research on Educational*, 37–41. <http://doi.org/10.1080/19345747.2013.836765>
- Yousefi, S., & Mohammadi, M. (2016). Critical Thinking and Reading Comprehension among Postgraduate Students: The Case of Gender and Language Proficiency Level. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol. 7 (4), 802-807. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0704.23>.